

MINUTES

HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION

September 14, 2022

Minutes of the regular hearing of the Historic Preservation commission, of the City of Tempe, which was held in hybrid format in person at City Council Chambers, 31 East 5th Street, Tempe, AZ, and virtually through WebEx.

Regular Meeting 6:02 PM

Present:

Staff:

Kyle Woodson	Zachary Lechner, Historic Preservation Officer
Dave Fackler	Ambika Adhikari, Principal Planner, Com Dev
Chris Garraty	Joanna Barry, Administrative Assistant II, Com Dev
Elizabeth Gilbert	Jennifer Daniels, Admirative Assistant II, Com Dev
Laurene Montero	Jeff Tamulevich, Director, Com Dev
Kiyomi Kurooka	
Reylynne Williams	
Gregory Larson	
Brenda Abney, ex officio member	

- 1) **Call to Audience:** Persons wishing to address the Commission on any matter may do so at the discretion of the Chair. However, Arizona Open Meeting Law limits Commission discussion to matters listed on the posted agenda. Other topics may be placed on a future agenda for discussion.

Mr. Robert Moore, Tempe resident, spoke on the community property Danelle Plaza (RFQ23049) at the southwest corner of Southern Avenue and Mill Avenue. Mr. Moore is hoping the City of Tempe will encourage potential developers to honor the property as a contribution to the city's local creative heritage as a cultural landscape feature. More information can be found at Danelleproject.org.

- 2) **Voting of the Meeting Minutes**

Motion by Commissioner Montero to approve the amended Meeting Minutes of August 10, 2022; second by Commissioner Gilbert. Motion passed on **8-0** vote.

Ayes: Kyle Woodson, Dave Fackler, Chris Garraty, Elizabeth Gilbert, Kiyomi Kurooka, Gregory Larson
Laurene Montero, and Reylynne Williams.

Nays: None

Abstain: None

Absent: Jim Garrison

- 3) **Approval of Agenda**

Chair Woodson approved the change to the order of the agenda items. Agenda Item #4--Request for Certificate of Appropriateness at the Strong residence property (PL220013/HPO20001)—was moved to Agenda Item #6. Approved as amended without objection.

- 4) **Guadalupe Cemetery Zoning Map Amendment Request**

Request for approval of a zoning map amendment from "AG, Agricultural Zoning District," to "AG(H), Agricultural with a Historic Overlay Property Designation," for Guadalupe Cemetery, located at 4649 South Beck Avenue, to facilitate the designation of Guadalupe Cemetery in the Tempe Historic Property Register. The applicant is the Town of Guadalupe. Dr. Karl Hoerig will present. **(PL220196 / HPO220009)**

Dr. Hoerig stated he has spoken with contacts from the Four Southern Tribes and received all positive feedback. He has also completed all of the local and state processes for the National Register of Historic Places nomination for the property.

Chair Woodson noted that the process is moving forward.

Dr. Lechner stated that if the Historic Overlay is approved, the project will move forward to the Development Review Commission (DRC). If approved by the DRC, it will move to City Council. If approved by City Council, the property will be designated as "Historic" and listed in the Tempe Historic Property Register.

Motion to approve zoning map amendment from "AG, Agricultural Zoning District," to "AG(H), Agricultural with a Historic Overlay Property Designation," for Guadalupe Cemetery, to facilitate the designation of Guadalupe Cemetery in the Tempe Historic Property Register (PL220196) by Commissioner Montero; second by Commissioner Garraty.

Motion passed on **8-0** vote.

Ayes: Kyle Woodson, Dave Fackler, Chris Garraty, Elizabeth Gilbert, Kiyomi Kurooka, Gregory Larson, Laurene Montero, and Reylynne Williams.

Nays: None

Abstain: None

Absent: Jim Garrison

5) **Gonzales-Martinez House Update**

Dr. Lechner gave a presentation on the Gonzales-Martinez House, located at 321 West 1st Street, Tempe. The property is Historic Eligible for the Tempe Historic Property Register. The property has been listed since 1984 in the National Register of Historic Places. Next to Hayden House, the Gonzales-Martinez House is the oldest standing structure still located in Tempe. The home was built in 1880. An addition was made to the house in 1918, which is also considered historic. There are some ca. 1985 additions to the home not considered historic. The City of Tempe owns the home and roughly half of the lot the home sits on. The rest of the property is state-owned. The City of Tempe came into ownership of the eastern half of the property, which contains the home, after a legal dispute. The city has been working on preserving the 1880 original adobe and the 1918 sections of the home. The sections built ca. 1985 will most likely be demolished during the renovation. Some of the security measures taken by the City include installing boards over the holes in the walls and putting up fencing around the house. The property contains four (4) outbuildings, two (2) of which are not considered historic.

In 2017, the City hired Motley Design Group to complete a Building Condition Assessment Report (BCAR) for the house. The estimated cost to make repairs and restore the house back to its historic appearance was \$267,828. Due to inflation, the 2022 cost would now be over \$300,000. Reggie McKay of Adobe Technologies was hired in 2021 for the adobe stabilization. City of Tempe Capital Improvement Program (CIP) funds in the amount of \$108,336 have been previously allocated for this project. Mr. McKay did some work on the house. He was unable to continue due to security concerns involving damage to his tools and other items left onsite. He also expressed a concern about his contract with the City. The City would like to clean up the property and redevelop the site. The City has allocated \$200,000 in CIP funds for fiscal year 2022-2023. This is to provide a match for a Heritage Fund Historic Preservation (HFHP) Grant, provided by Arizona State Parks and Trails. The deadline to apply for the first round of funding is November 1. The City will be asking Arizona States Parks and Trails for \$150,000. An agenda item seeking an HPC resolution in support of rehabilitating the Gonzales-Martinez House will be added to the October HPC agenda as evidence of public support for the property and for the HFHP Grant.

Commissioner Kurooka asked Dr. Lechner if the City has a plan for the house once the property is redeveloped.

Dr. Lechner stated the City is unsure of future use at this time.

Chair Woodson asked if Dr. Lechner thought the City would be able to resolve the issue with the parcel owned by the state. Will it become an entirely City-owned parcel? Dr. Lechner stated he hopes so and discussed the challenges. A former Tempe mayor had previously been enlisted to try to move the process along. The City is highly motivated to make this happen.

Commissioner Montero said she had the same question as Commissioner Kurooka about what the building may be used for once the project is complete.

Dr. Lechner stated that the question of what the building will be used for is something that the City will want to consult with the Commission on, as it has done and will continue to do with the Hayden Flour Mill. Any developers that may enter talks with the City would be advised to bring their ideas before the Commission for input.

Commissioner Larson commented that the presentation was informative and thorough.

Commissioner Kurooka stated that she hopes the City has some idea or vision on what the plan is before completing the project.

Dr. Lechner and Chair Woodson agreed.

Chair Woodson issued a call to the audience for anyone wishing to speak on agenda item Gonzalez-Martinez House.

Mr. Rob Moore, Tempe resident, thanked the Commission and HPO for their continued efforts on the Gonzales-Martinez House. Mr. Moore stated he hopes this unique piece of Tempe history will be protected effectively and the rehabilitation plans will make it easily accessible to the community, serving as a source for education and exploration for generations to come.

6) Strong Residence Property Certificate of Appropriateness Request

Request for a Certificate of Appropriateness to convert the existing garage into living space and to add a new detached garage at the Strong residence property, located at 137 West Palmcroft Drive, a contributing property in the Tempe Historic Property Register-designated Date Palm Manor Historic District. The applicant is Jeremiah Domenech. **(PL220013 / HPO220001)**

Mr. Jeremiah Domenech was unable to attend tonight's meeting. Mr. Justin Carlson (co-homeowner) stated that several months ago his and Ms. Devi Davis-Strong's home was approved for a 2nd story addition. Due to costs of the project, the homeowners were unable to move forward with the 2nd story addition. Mr. Carlson was made aware that a neighbor had added a building behind their residence and decided that would be more cost-effective.

Mr. Carlson, attending via WebEx, became inaudible.

Ms. Devi Davis-Strong (co-homeowner) continued with the presentation. Ms. Davis-Strong stated that the new building will be much smaller than the previously approved 2nd story addition and will not be seen from the front of the house.

Commissioner Kurooka asked Ms. Davis-Strong if the neighbor that built the large structure used prefabricated construction.

Ms. Davis-Strong stated that it is a similar material. She will be using a corrugated metal. Ms. Davis-Strong stated that this building will not be a home. It will be used as a garage.

Chair Woodson asked if there was another property in the historic district with a prefabricated metal shed that the prior HPC approved. Ms. Davis-Strong stated that is what she understood.

Dr. Lechner stated that he cannot verify that the other property's approval came through the HPC. Dr. Lechner asked the Commissioners to judge this design on its own standards.

Chair Woodson asked Ms. Davis-Strong to clarify the statement that the new structure will not be visible. Based on the design, is it about 2 feet taller than the structure in front of it? When stating that it is not visible, does that mean it is not visible at all or from certain angles?

Ms. Davis-Strong stated that the new structure will not be taller than the house. The house is 12 feet tall. The current house 1750 square feet. The new garage will be 1200 square feet.

Chair Woodson discussed the compatibility issue regarding the previous approved 2nd story. Chair Woodson asked if Ms. Davis-Strong did or can look into any other options for the appearance and/or design of the front-facing part of the new building that is more compatible with the existing house.

Mr. Ambika Adhikari stated that possibly the material, pattern, color, or windows could be changed to be compatible with the current home.

Dr. Lechner addressed the Commission and asked the Commissioners to consider if the addition's lack of visibility supersedes the fact that, on all accounts, it does not abide by good historic preservation principles.

Chair Woodson asked what color the new structure will be.

Ms. Davis-Strong stated that there was not a plan to paint the new structure but is willing to paint the new structure.

Chair Woodson stated that any color that was compatible with the current house color would be a way to address the proposed condition of approval pertaining to paint.

Dr. Lechner stated that the color can be the same as the house or any compatible color (e.g., lighter gray, darker gray, or white.)

Ms. Davis-Strong asked if there were other elements that would make the building more appealing besides starting all over with an architect.

Dr. Lechner stated that the options are limited due to the material being prefabricated.

Ms. Davis-Strong stated that the home must be livable and would like the Commission to consider that aspect.

Commissioner Williams asked Dr. Lechner about the Certificate of Appropriateness. Since the Commission has previously approved a Certificate of Appropriateness for a two-story addition in March, does the Commission have to rescind that Certificate of Appropriateness before voting on a new certificate? Or can the previous motion be amended to include the new certificate?

Dr. Lechner stated the Certificate of Appropriateness does not need to be repealed. It would not be amended because the Certificate of Appropriateness is attached to a specific set of design plans. When a design changes, new plans are submitted through the HPO, which determines whether the revised plans are close enough to what was originally approved by the HPC. If so, the HPO will issue a Certificate of No Effect, meaning the prior Certificate of Appropriateness remains in effect. If the design is different enough, a new request for a Certificate of Appropriateness must go through the HPC again.

Vice Chair Dave Fackler asked Dr. Lechner, if the Commission approves the Certificate of Appropriateness, what is the procedure it will still have to go through? Will a use permit still be needed because the project is no longer a 2nd story addition?

Mr. Adhikari stated it will go through the building permit section and the DRC for a use permit.

Vice Chair Fackler asked if the HPC was the appropriate Commission to be voting on this design.

Dr. Lechner stated that the HPC is mandated to consider this project because it involves a contributing property in a Tempe Historic Property Register-designated Historic District.

Vice Chair Fackler asked Ms. Davis-Strong what type of input has been received from the adjacent neighbors including across the alley.

Ms. Davis-Strong stated that a neighborhood meeting was held when the plan was a 2nd story addition. A 2nd neighborhood meeting was not done on the revised plans. No neighbors objected to the 2nd story addition. Ms. Davis-Strong stated that she was under the impression she only needed a neighborhood meeting if a variance was needed for the plans.

Vice Chair Fackler asked staff about the previous proposal and current proposal showing a zero-lot line construction on the southern boundary of the property adjacent to the alley. A note from the project architect stated that the zero-lot line was approvable by the city.

Dr. Lechner said he was not able to 100% confirm that it was previously approved.

Motion to approve request for a Certificate of Appropriateness to convert the existing garage into living space and to add a new detached garage at the Strong residence property with the 4 conditions listed (PL220013) by Commissioner Montero: second by Commissioner Larson.

Motion passed on **5-3** vote.

Ayes: Chris Garraty, Elizabeth Gilbert, Gregory Larson, Laurene Montero, and Reylynne Williams

Nays: Kyle Woodson, Dave Fackler, and Kiyomi Kurooka

Abstain: None

Absent: Jim Garrison

7) Chair / Staff Updates

Mr. Adhikari updated the Commission on the Butler-Gray House. The zoning map amendment was recommended for approval by the DRC on 8/23 and the first hearing by City Council occurred on 9/8. The second and final Council hearing will occur on 9/22.

Dr. Lechner updated the Commission that the City's plan to install gates across the alcoves on the Old Mill Avenue Bridge will not be moving forward at this time. Ongoing maintenance and cleanup will continue.

Dr. Lechner told the HPC that the City of Tempe was awarded a \$20,000 Certified Local Government (CLG) Pass-Through Grant from the State Historic Preservation Office (SHPO), with a match from the City, to fund the creation of a context study of Asian Americans in Tempe.

8) Current Events / Announcements / Future Agenda Items

Member Announcements

Staff Announcements

Dr. Lechner covered the tentative October agenda.

Chair Woodson asked that staff research the Date-Palm Manor for the other property stated by Ms. Davis-Strong as having a prefabricated metal garage. Was it a non-contributing property? Did it go through proper channels?

Vice Chair Fackler asked staff to look into whether the Strong Residence planning application received

approval for a zero-lot line on the property's southern boundary. *(A subsequent investigation by Dr. Lechner confirmed that a variance would not be needed for the zero-lot line because it borders an alley.)*

Meeting adjourned at 7:49 pm.

Prepared by: Jennifer Daniels, Administrative Assistant
Reviewed by: Zachary Lechner, Historic Preservation Officer

jd:zl