

MINUTES

HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION

June 8, 2022

Minutes of the regular hearing of the Historic Preservation commission, of the City of Tempe, which was held in hybrid format in person at City Council Chambers, 31 East 5th Street, Tempe, AZ, and virtually through WebEx.

Regular Meeting 6:00 PM

Present:

Staff:

Kyle Woodson	Steve Abrahamson, Principal Planner
Dave Fackler	Ambika Adhikari, Principal Planner
Chris Garraty	Zachary Lechner, Historic Preservation Officer
Elizabeth Gilbert	Ryan Levesque, Deputy Director, Planning
Laurene Montero	Joanna Barry, Administrative Assistant II, Com Dev
Kiyomi Kurooka	
Reylynne Williams	
Jim Garrison	
Gregory Larson	

- 1) **Call to Audience:** Persons wishing to address the Commission on any matter may do so at the discretion of the Chair. However, Arizona Open Meeting Law limits Commission discussion to matters listed on the posted agenda. Other topics may be placed on a future agenda for discussion.

No audience members were present.

- 2) **Voting of the Meeting Minutes**

Commissioner Williams noted that on page 2, under Item #4, it references “Ms. Reilly,” which is a misspelling. Also, under Item #5 under Commission Discussion, in the third paragraph, “approval” is misspelled with a “c”. On page 5, under Item #7, in the ninth paragraph, the minutes state that Commissioner Williams’s statement referred to the City of Phoenix project, but she was in fact referring to a City of Tempe project.

Motion by Vice Chair Fackler to approve the amended Meeting Minutes of May 11, 2022; second by Commissioner Gilbert. Motion passed on **8-0** vote.

Ayes: Kyle Woodson, Dave Fackler, Chris Garraty, Elizabeth Gilbert, Kiyomi Kurooka, Laurene Montero, Jim Garrison, and Reylynne Williams

Nays: None

Abstain: Gregory Larson

Absent: None

- 3) **Approval of Agenda**

Vice Chair asked that if someone had an item to add to the agenda, would it be for the next meeting. Dr. Lechner stated it would be for the items on the current agenda; or example if a Commissioner wanted to change the order of the agenda items to be heard. Chair Woodson stated he believes that you can also add an item to the agenda. Ryan Levesque, Deputy Director – Community Development, stated that due to the Open Meeting Law notification requirements, any added items would need to be published at least 24 hours in advance of the meeting. Chair Woodson asked if it is possible to introduce an item at the meeting, then add it to the next agenda and was advised it was.

Motion by Vice Chair Fackler to approve the approve the June 8, 2002, agenda; second by Commissioner Larson. Motion passed on **9-0** vote.

Ayes: Kyle Woodson, Dave Fackler, Chris Garraty, Elizabeth Gilbert, Kiyomi Kurooka, Gregory Larson, Laurene Montero, Jim Garrison, and Reylynne Williams

Nays: None

Abstain: None

Absent: None

- 4) **Review of nomination of Guadalupe Cemetery, located at 4649 South Beck Avenue, to the National Register of Historic Places. Solicitation of Tempe HPC review was made by the Arizona State Historic Preservation Office. HPC comments will be forwarded to the Historic Sites Review Committee, which, at its July 8, 2022, meeting, will determine whether to forward the nomination to the National Park Service's Keeper of the Register for possible inclusion in the National Register. The nomination was prepared by Dr. Karl A. Hoerig, Tribal Historic Preservation Officer for the Pascua Yaqui Tribe, on behalf of the Town of Guadalupe.**

Dr. Lechner advised the Commission that this item is not up for a vote, but rather to give Dr. Hoerig some feedback from the Commission. He gave an overview of the remaining process this item will go through.

Chair Woodson advised that the State Historic Preservation Office has requested that if the City or any of the Commissioners have any comments that they return them by July 5, 2022, so Commissioners are able to submit comments formally. He also asked that clarification be made to the Commission that this is for the National Historic Register nomination that they are having the presentation this evening, however it is also anticipated that this will be submitted for a City of Tempe Historic Property Register (THPR) designation. Dr. Lechner advised that he would explain more about the THPR designation process during the staff update portion of this meeting.

Dr. Karl A. Hoerig, Tribal Historic Preservation Officer for the Pascua Yaqui Tribe, gave an overview of the history of the site and nomination request.

Commissioner Montero noted that the request relies on National Register criterion D (archaeological) and suggested he might want to beef up the Los Hornos aspect. She is aware this request is not about that; however, she wondered if the Criterion D material was currently strong enough and if Los Hornos might be able to make a stronger case for Criterion D. Dr. Hoerig stated that Los Hornos has previously been determined to be eligible as a Hohokam site. He noted that he did mention it in the nomination but did not emphasize it because the current historic significance of the property is to the Town of Guadalupe community, the vast majority of whom were not aware it was there. Commissioner Montero noted that cemeteries can be a bit tricky to add to the National Register so if they could get that Criterion D eligibility it would be easier to get it listed.

Commissioner Larson stated he enjoyed reading the application and that it is well written and informative. One portion that caught his attention was that there are no photographs. He respects the reverence for the graves of ancestors, but he wonders if an appropriate photograph might be of the gate from afar while it is closed, bearing the words Guadalupe Cemetery, as long as there are no images of the actual grave sites. Dr. Hoerig advised the reason he did not do that to start with was because the gates that are there now were added in the late 1970s and it is a non-contributing feature. However, he does not think there would be any objections from the community of adding that picture.

Commissioner Williams asked Dr. Hoerig if he has done any research to see if there are any other Native American cemeteries that have been nominated to the National Register as a traditional cultural property. Commissioner Williams noted that because of the cultural site that is within the property of the cemetery, there should be consultation with the Four Southern Tribes because of the O'odham's association with Hohokam archaeological sites. Dr. Hoerig stated that makes total sense and asked Commissioner Williams if he could contact her to get on an agenda of the Four Southern Tribes Cultural Resource Working Group. She advised him that would be fine, and she will let him know when the next Four Southern Tribes meeting is scheduled.

Chair Woodson asked Dr. Hoerig to clarify what the land ownership status is and how it relates to the Town of Guadalupe and the City of Tempe. Dr. Hoerig advised that the property is owned by the Town of Guadalupe. It was quit-claim deeded from the Catholic Church to the town, he thinks in 1979, so it is a Town of Guadalupe property that is located in the City of Tempe. Chair Woodson asked if this is the only such parcel within the City of Tempe that is owned by the Town of Guadalupe. Dr. Hoerig is not sure but would guess that it is. Chair Woodson noted that the criterion deed notation mentions the site of Los Hornos, however asked that since the original town site was located in this area if there was any consideration of including any part of what may or may not be left of the town site in the nomination or if it was just for the cemetery. Dr. Hoerig advised that they do not have any evidence that there is any remaining evidence of the town site at the property. The most substantial building there was the adobe church that was located on the southwest corner of the property. By 1928 there was only one of the adobe walls left, so he does not believe there is anything there. There were Yaqui homes built atop of the platform mound but that was razed in the 1950s. Chair Woodson noted it is a five-acre parcel and asked if it is entirely enclosed and locked to only those with access. Dr. Hoerig advised it is completely surrounded by residential developments. The access gate on the southwest corner is accessible from the south on Beck Avenue and is opened daily by the caretakers of the cemetery so people can come in and out. Chair Woodson asked if there was an estimate of how many graves are in this cemetery. Dr. Hoerig noted that the cemetery continues to be used and they have not tried to get a precise number of graves as there is no existing map of the burials. The use of the cemetery has been informal for the 120+ years it has been in use, so he cannot tell how many graves there are currently.

Commissioner Larson asked if burials are continuing to occur at the cemetery. Dr. Hoerig said that there are and that this does not make it ineligible for the National Register. He noted there is continued concern within the community of the cemetery running out of space because there is not any other space in the community that the town has identified that can be used as a cemetery.

Vice Chair Fackler advised he has been to this cemetery many times over the years and that in his mind it is one of the most beautiful cemeteries in Arizona. He is glad there are no pictures in the nomination as it is protected since no one knows where it is located or that it is there.

Dr. Lechner advised the Commission of the next steps in the process. He will be forwarding comments he receives to Dr. Hoerig and see if SHPO also wants them, but there is no actionable item on the HPC's part. Chair Woodson asked if Dr. Hoerig has sought a letter of support from the City of Tempe, or if it is needed. Dr. Hoerig advised that he has not requested one, but it would be appreciated, however it would not be submitted with the nomination to the National Register. Even though it is not required, Chair Woodson requested a vote be taken for the record on support for this item.

Motion by Commissioner Montero to support the Historic Preservation Officer to issue an email or letter to the State Historic Preservation Office supporting this nomination; second by Vice Chair Fackler. Motion passed on **8-1** vote.

Ayes: Kyle Woodson, Dave Fackler, Chris Garraty, Elizabeth Gilbert, Kiyomi Kurooka, Gregory Larson, Laurene Montero, and Jim Garrison

Nays: Reylynne Williams

Abstain: None

Absent: None

5) Chair/Staff Updates

Chair Woodson had no updates.

Dr. Lechner noted that Dr. Hoerig had also submitted, with the support of the Town of Guadalupe, a nomination to designate Guadalupe Cemetery in the Tempe Historic Property Register. There will be a neighborhood meeting and he plans to hold this on a Historic Preservation Commission agenda as an item so the public will be able to attend and speak about the proposed designation while also keeping the HPC informed. This would be planned for the August meeting, not the July one. Mr. Levesque advised that this is because a neighborhood meeting has to be held at least 30 days prior to the first public hearing. Dr. Lechner then went over the remaining steps in the process that includes hearings by the Development Review Commission and the City Council.

Dr. Lechner gave an update of the CLG Pass-Through grant. Previously, Vice Chair Fackler had suggested applying for funds to have a City-approved contractor complete a comprehensive historic context study of Asian Americans in Tempe. This would aid in identifying key resources important to Asian American history in Tempe as well as shed light on the history of this key demographic group which is the 3rd largest in the City of Tempe according to the 2020 census. This would start by holding interviews with the Asian American community. Some of interviews have already been conducted in the past for other reasons and they are housed in the Tempe History Museum. Architectural Consulting Services, the same company that completed the recent historical inventories and the updated Historic Preservation Plan, has produced a scope of work that places cost of the project at approximately \$41,000. The pass-through grant maxes out at \$20,000 and then the CLG would be required to come up with at least a 40% funding match as a part of the requirement to receive the grant. The HPO is currently looking at some supplementary funding sources for the match as well as to cover the balance of the City's cost. Chair Woodson asked if that at some point Dr. Lechner could send an email to the Commissioners about what other historic contexts are already written for the city. Dr. Lechner agreed that he would.

Dr. Lechner noted that at the last HPC meeting, the two inventories of historical resources in Tempe as well as the HP Plan were recommended for forwarding to the City Council for approval. These were meant to be taken to the May 26, 2022 City Council meeting; however, a decision was made to delay these until the June 23rd meeting. The reason for this is that the State Historic Preservation Office that received the plan and inventories had gotten back to the City and advised that their review was not going to be done in time for the May 26th City Council meeting. They had some minor comments on the HP Plan that were later incorporated by Architectural Consulting Services. Comments were also received on one of the inventories and ACS also incorporated those minor revisions. The City recently received SHPO's comments on the second inventory (1961-75) and is awaiting ACS's turnaround on the revisions, which should be done at the end of the week.

Chair Woodson referenced the last Commission meeting where Mr. Jared Smith advised he would no longer be joining the meeting and someone else would be taking part in future meetings. He asked for an update on this and Dr. Lechner advised that he currently did not have one. He has not been contacted by Mr. Smith or his replacement so he will reach out to them.

6) Current Events/ Announcements / Future Agenda Items

Member Announcements

Staff Announcements

Dr. Lechner gave the Commission an update on the July HPC agenda. The City Manager's office will be applying for a Certificate of Appropriateness for the installation of gates on the alcoves on the Old Mill Avenue Bridge. There has been a concern raised regarding the City's homeless population using the location for illicit or other purpose. This is creating a potential safety hazard and there has been a lot of effort from the police department and cleaning crews to clear out the alcoves and keep them clean.

Motion by Vice Chair Fackler to adjourn; second by Commissioner Larson. Motion passed on **9-0** vote.

Ayes: Kyle Woodson, Dave Fackler, Chris Garraty, Elizabeth Gilbert, Gregory Larson, Kiyomi Kurooka, Laurene Montero, Jim Garrison and Reyllynne Williams

Nays: None

Abstain: None

Absent: None

Hearing adjourned at 7:06 pm.

Prepared by: Joanna Barry, Administrative Assistant II

Reviewed by: Zachary Lechner, Historic Preservation Officer