

**Tempe Aviation Commission**  
**Tuesday, February 8, 2022**  
**6:30 p.m. – Call to Order**

**Virtual**

Microsoft Teams meeting, [Click here to join the meeting](#)  
Or call in (audio only), [+1 480-498-8745](#) United States, Phoenix  
Phone Conference ID: 633 428 047#

**AGENDA**

1. **Call to Order**
2. **Public Appearances;** the Tempe Aviation Commission welcomes public comments at this time. The Commission may not respond to public comments unless the topic has been placed on the agenda. There is a *three-minute time limit* per citizen.
3. **Consideration of Meeting Minutes (January 11, 2022);** for discussion and approval.
4. **Website and Information Page;** for discussion
5. **Rio Salado Upcoming Development presentation;** for discussion
6. **Commissioners' Business;** suggestions for future agenda items.
7. **Schedule Next TAVCO Meeting – Tuesday, March 8**
8. **Adjournment.**

According to the Arizona Open Meeting Law, the Commission may only discuss matters listed on the Commission agenda. The City of Tempe endeavors to make all public meetings accessible to persons with disabilities. With 48 hours advance notice, special assistance is available at public meetings for sight and/or hearing-impaired persons. Please call 350-2905 (voice) or 350-8400 (TDD) to request an accommodation to participate in a public meeting. Parking information is available at <http://www.millavenue.com/go/tempe-community-council>. For public transportation route and schedule information, please visit [www.valleymetro.org](http://www.valleymetro.org) or call 602-253-5000.

# Minutes

## Tempe Aviation Commission

### January 11, 2022

Minutes of the Tempe Aviation Commission meeting - virtual Microsoft Teams meeting with call in +1 (480) 498-8745 United States, Phoenix (Toll) Conference ID: 243 160 897# held on January 11, 2022, 6:30 p.m.

**(MEMBERS) Present:**

W. David Doiron  
Stuart Mitnik  
Ellen Poole  
Peter Schelstraete  
Karen J. Apple  
Ed Kucharski  
Desiree Walker  
John Lynch  
Aaron McBride

**Citizens Present:**

Jasdeep Mandia  
Julie Rodriguez

**City Staff Present:**

Braden Kay, Sustainability Office, City of Tempe  
Brienne Fisher, Sustainability Office, City of Tempe  
Andy Escobar, Sustainability Office, City of Tempe  
Lauren Kuby, City Councilmember

**(MEMBERS) Absent:**

**Agenda Item 1 – Call to Order**

Mr. Doiron called the meeting to order at 6:30p.m.

**Agenda Item 2 – Public Appearances**

Jasdeep Mandia is a 4th-year doctoral student at Arizona State University. Mr. Mandia was in attendance to present his ongoing research on noise pollution's effects on property value in the Phoenix Metropolitan Area.

Julie Rodriguez did not present herself.

**Agenda Item 3 – Consideration of Meeting Minutes (December 14, 2021)**

Mr. Doiron asked if anyone had considerations of minutes such as discrepancies or corrections.

Motion: Mr. Mitnik moved to approve minutes. The motion was seconded by Mr. Kucharski.

Action: The motion to approve was passed by a unanimous vote. Ayes: Ms. Apple, Mr.

Carraway, Mr. Kucharski, Dr. Lynch, Mr. Mitnik, Ms. Poole, Mr. Schelstraete, Mr. Doiron and Ms. Walker Nays: None. Abstentions: None. Absent: None.

**Agenda Item 4 – Sky Harbor Noise Issues presentation**

Mr. Mandia gave a presentation on the key findings from his research. His presentation, Ongoing Research: Effect of Noise Pollution on the Housing Market in Phoenix Metro Area, detailed the negative effects of noise pollution, research methodology, and data findings. Mr. Mandia explained that his findings are relevant to policymaking. Mr. Mandia showed three periods of flight paths: Conventional, NextGen and Partial Reversal. Mr. Mandia explained that housing data came from the Maricopa County Assessor's Office. Mr. Mandia collected data by comparing noise exposure during all three flight path periods and how it affected property value. Mr. Mandia stated his research is ongoing.

During the presentation, the following questions were asked:

- Mr. Mitnik asked if there were 700,000 individual data points in Mr. Mandia's housing database chart.
  - Mr. Mandia confirmed they were individual data points but has around 3.9 million housing transactions collected from all across Maricopa County.
- Mr. Mitnik asked Mr. Mandia to clarify that the data is showing the number of property exchange transactions and not the number of flights over specific residences.
  - Mr. Mandia said that was correct.
- Mr. Doiron asked what the time period was on Mr. Mandia's polygraphs.
  - Mr. Mandia answered that it was over a one-week period.
- Mr. Kucharski asked if there was a differentiation between approach and departure.
  - Mr. Mandia explained that presentation's images was showing aircraft departures but explained that there is a difference in aircraft arrivals.
- Mr. Mitnik stated that Mr. Mandia's nomenclature is confusing and suggested he switch use "Original" in place of "Conventional".
  - Mr. Mandia thanked him for his observation and explained that he is using the same vocabulary used in Sky Harbor reports.
  - Ms. Walker stated that the FAA uses the same terminology as Mr. Mandia.
  - Mr. Mitnik explained that the presentation's flow was confusing due to not knowing the context of the information.
- Ms. Poole asked Mr. Mandia to clarify if it was decibel level 35 that affected property values.
  - Mr. Mandia stated that it was decibel level 55 or more that affect health and property prices.
- Mr. Mitnik asked Mr. Mandia if he could correlate the change in noise complaints to the change in environmental noise and if it has created more complaints in these specific areas.

- Mr. Mandia explained his data was gathered from Sky Harbor Phoenix Airport and that he could correlate changes between the two.
- Mr. Kucharski asked Mr. Mandia to clarify if the noise complaint lawsuits were against the airport or the FAA in the case Mr. Mandia was speaking about.
  - Mr. Mandia answered that most of the lawsuits were against the FAA.
- Ms. Poole stated that Mr. Mandia's research might be of interest to the Maricopa Association of Governance and would like to connect him to the department.
  - Mr. Mandia expressed his interest in the connection and thanked Ms. Poole.
- Ms. Walker asked Mr. Mandia if he was familiar with the airport noise disclosure maps that are filed with the state.
  - Mr. Mandia stated that he has asked Sky Harbor Airport for those maps but was told they did not exist.
  - Mr. Doiron stated that Mr. Mandia might have spoken to an employee that was unaware of the noise disclosure maps.
  - Ms. Walker explained that all of Sky Harbor's three airports disclose noise maps that real estate agents must show to homebuyers to sign. Ms. Walker shared weblinks to this information in the chat.
- Mr. Mitnik asked Mr. Mandia if he will regress the real estate data against the noise map to create a regression analysis or develop a methodology to create a causation.
  - Mr. Mandia explained that he will be doing a regression analysis.
- Mr. Doiron asked Mr. Mandia to explain his use of the word 'regression' in his research.
  - Mr. Mandia explained that he uses an independent and dependent variable, such as noise pollution affecting property prices.
  - Mr. Doiron explained that the word 'regression' is normally used for something else and that it was difficult to follow the presentation due to the misuse of the word.
- Mr. Doiron asked if Mr. Mandia used a control group for his conclusion.
  - Mr. Mandia explained there was a comparison between properties that did not face an increase in noise exposure and properties that did.
  - Mr. Doiron asked Mr. Mandia to confirm that properties outside the noise exposure had no effect but were still affected by stock market prices.
  - Mr. Mandia confirmed.
- Mr. Mitnik asked if Mr. Mandia could or planned to segregate industrial and residential properties.
  - Mr. Mandia stated he could.
- Mr. Mitnik asked how Mr. Mandia takes national economic upturns and downturns into account into his data.
  - Mr. Mandia explained that the dependent variable is flexible. Mr. Mandia can make a deeper analysis by studying the data for each year in which economic upturns and downturns could be considered a factor.

### **Agenda Item 5 – Rio Salado Upcoming Development presentation**

Mr. Doiron asked the commissioners if they had any questions about the agenda item. Mr. Doiron stated that City Council will have a discussion on Thursday and commissioners who are interested may enquire about it. Dr. Kay stated that Economic Development is not prepared to present but is aware that TAVCO would like a presentation of the agenda item. Dr. Kay committed to continue to monitor any actions.

Mr. Doiron stated that noise enforcement is divided between different authorities. The City of Phoenix is responsible when an aircraft is on the ground, and the federal government is responsible when an aircraft is in the air.

#### **Agenda Item 6 – Commissioners’ Business**

Mr. Doiron asked the commission to suggest agenda items to future meetings. Mr. Mitnik reminded the commission about the publication. Dr. Kay stated that he and Ms. Fisher have spoken about the communications wish list. Ms. Fisher will present ideas for a communications plan and will be added as an agenda item at a later time.

#### **Agenda Item 7 – Schedule Next TAVCO Meeting**

The next meeting was scheduled for February 8, 2022 at 6:30 p.m. as a hybrid option.

#### **Agenda Item 8 – Adjournment**

Motion: Mr. Lynch moved to adjourn the meeting. The motion was seconded by Mr. Kucharski.

Action: The motion to adjourn the meeting passed by a unanimous vote. Ayes: Ms. Apple, Mr. Carraway, Mr. Doiron, Mr. Kucharski, Dr. Lynch, Mr. Mitnik, Ms. Poole, Mr. Schelstraete and Ms. Walker. Nays: None. Abstentions: None. Absent: None.

The meeting adjourned at 7:27 p.m.

Prepared by: Andy Escobar

Reviewed by: Brianne Fisher

# MEMORANDUM

**TO:** TAVCO  
**THROUGH:** Braden Kay, Sustainability Director  
**FROM:** Brianne Fisher, Climate Action Plan  
**DATE:** February 8, 2022  
**SUBJECT:** TAVCO Website and Communications Update



---

**PURPOSE:**

Follow up from the October 12, 2021 TAVCO meeting agenda in regards to a communication plan and website updates.

**BACKGROUND INFORMATION:**

At the October 12, 2021 TAVCO meeting, Commission Members provided feedback and ideas for additional communication on aviation noise and TAVCO activity. Below is a summarized list of the feedback provided:

**List of Ideas:**

- Commissions mission, values and calendar of meetings
- 50-year IGA agreement
- Noise Maps
- Presentation from City dept and outside entities
- FAA resources
- Phone numbers
- Noise guidance
- Tempe monthly noise reports
- Past commission meetings and archive file and agenda
- Links that direct to Phoenix Sky Harbor
- Glossary for noise reports

**RECOMMENDATION:**

Staff will work with City of Tempe Media & Communication team to detail out and implement the website updates and media plan drafted below.

**Website Updates:**

City of Tempe, Climate Action Manager, Brianne Fisher held a meeting with City of Tempe Web-Designer and Public Information Officer on February 1, 2022 to discuss TAVCO's ideas for the website. Also discussed with the web-designers was the opportunity to incorporate new widgets and design that would more easily allow the reader to find the information they are looking for. City staff is committed to website changes to present to TAVCO at the Tuesday, March 8 Meeting.

**Media Plan:**

At the February 1, 2022 meeting Fisher had with city staff, she discussed developing a yearlong media plan. At the Tuesday, March 8 meeting, Fisher will present a more detailed media plan. Below is an outline of the opportunities that will be used to communicate TAVCO related news and updates:

**Proposed Media Plan –**

- Quarterly City of Tempe social media posts
  - Did you know...
  - Have you been impacted by aircraft noise...
  - History of aviation in Tempe
- November Aviation History Month
  - Celebration/activity/event
- Bi-Annual Tempe Today Submission
- Opportunities for Public Input
- Solicit Commission Member feedback