

## Agenda Item 8

# MEMORANDUM

TO: Historic Preservation Commission  
FROM: John Southard, Historic Preservation Officer  
DATE: November 10<sup>th</sup>, 2021  
SUBJECT: Agenda Item 8 – Approval of 2021 Historic Preservation Commission Annual Report



---

Board and commission staff liaisons are required to prepare annual reports “detailing the work of [their] board or commission,” which must then be reviewed and approved by their board or commission. Approved annual reports are subsequently submitted to the City Clerk and provided to the City Council for review. 2021 annual reports must be submitted to the City Clerk in December of 2021.

Staff has prepared a draft 2021 annual report for Historic Preservation Commission consideration and approval.

The draft 2020 Historic Preservation Commission Annual Report is attached.

## **ATTACHMENTS:**

Draft 2021 Historic Preservation Commission Annual Report



---

## HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION 2021 ANNUAL REPORT

---

### Description as Defined in Ordinance:

- (1) Reviewing applications for the designation of landmarks, historic properties and historic districts and making recommendations to the development review commission, such review shall be based on the criteria as specified in § 14A-4 of this chapter;
- (2) Reviewing and making decisions on applications for proposed alterations, new construction, demolition or removal affecting landmarks, historic properties or properties located within an historic district; such review shall be based on the criteria as specified in § 14A-6 of this chapter;
- (3) Making recommendations to the city council concerning the use of federal, state, city or available private funds to promote the preservation of properties and districts within the city, including acquisition, the awarding of such sub-grants as may become available and the requiring of preservation covenants, as well as the acquisition of preservation easements;
- (4) Recommending to the city council and other applicable boards and commissions, changes in the Zoning and Development Code, building code, general plan or other local laws as may enhance the purposes of this chapter;
- (5) Cooperating with representatives designated by the property owners of the district from designated historic districts to formulate design guidelines for alterations and new construction within their districts;
- (6) Initiating and conducting detailed studies and surveys of properties, structures and areas within the city and assess their potential for designation, and in order to formulate an historic preservation plan for the city; and
- (7) Developing and participating in public information activities in order to increase public awareness of the value of historic preservation, and perform other functions that will encourage or further the interests of historic preservation.

TCC § {14A-3(k)}

### List of Board and Commission Members, Including Attendance and Service Dates:

<u>Board/Commission Members:</u>	<u>Service Dates:</u>	<u>Attendance Record:</u>
Martin Ball	June 2017 – August 2021	Attended 5, 2 absences
Matthew Bilsbarrow	March 2017 – August 2021	Attended 0, 0 absences
Charles Buss	December 2013 – Present	Attended 9, 0 absences
Christopher Garraty	March 2017 – Present	Attended 9, 0 absences
James Garrison	September 2016 – Present	Attended 7, 2 absences
Elizabeth Gilbert	April 2018 – Present	Attended 6, 3 absences
Gregory Larson	March 2018 – Present	Attended 8, 1 absence
Laurene Montero	March 2018 – Present	Attended 9, 0 absences
Joseph Nucci	March 2017 – Present	Attended 9, 0 absences
Reylynne Williams	August 2021 – Present	Attended 3, 0 absences
Kyle Woodson	August 2021 – Present	Attended 3, 0 absences

### Name of Chair and Vice Chair:

- Chair – Charles Buss
- Vice Chair – VACANT

**Staff Liaison and Contact Information:**

<u>Staff Liaison:</u>	<u>Department:</u>	<u>Phone:</u>	<u>Email:</u>
John Southard	Community Development	(480) 350-8870	john_southard@tempe.gov

**Meeting Frequency and Location:**

The Historic Preservation Commission convened ten out of eleven months in calendar year 2021 (report prepared and approved in November; information regarding the December meeting is not available at time of approval). With the exception of the November meeting, which was held in a hybrid format, all 2021 meetings were held virtually due to the COVID-19 pandemic. While the day and time will remain the same, future meetings will be held in the City of Tempe City Council Chambers.

**Number of Meetings Cancelled and Reason for Cancellation:**

The Historic Preservation Commission did not meet in July due to a lack of action items.

**Vacancies and Duration of Vacancies:**

There were two vacancies in 2021; both were filled within one month.

**Subcommittee and Subcommittee Activity:**

Did the Board/Commission have any subcommittees active during the reporting period?  YES  NO

Formation of the Subcommittee on Alternatives to Demolition of the Historic First Congregation Church was approved by the Historic Preservation Commission on November 18<sup>th</sup>, 2020. The subcommittee will sunset on November 18<sup>th</sup>, 2021, one year from the date of its formation.

**Mission Statement:**

The Tempe Historic Preservation Plan (Resolution 97.44; Resolution 2000.34) follows:

**I. Introduction**

Tempe enjoys a rich multi-cultural heritage evident through its historic buildings, neighborhoods and structures. Less visible, but equally important, are the archaeological resources of Tempe's past. Protection and enhancement of Tempe's heritage is critical to preserving the unique identity of our community. The blending of the past with the present enriches our city and all of its citizens.

In November of 1995, both as an expression of civic pride and the beginning of the future of historic preservation in Tempe, the Tempe City Council unanimously adopted the Tempe Historic Preservation Ordinance. Most importantly, the ordinance created the Tempe Historic Preservation Commission, the Office of the Tempe Historic Preservation Officer, and the Tempe Historic Property Register.

As one of its first acts, the Commission prepared a Preservation Plan. The Plan identified goals and policies for historic preservation in Tempe. These goals and policies are hereby refined and updated.

**II. Goals**

The Commission recognizes three goals for historic preservation in Tempe:

1. To identify, preserve and protect significant historic properties and archaeological sites.
2. To foster economic vitality through preservation of properties which contribute to the historic character of the community.
3. To integrate historic preservation planning with that conducted by boards, commissions, neighborhood and redevelopment

planning efforts as a means to protect and enhance community heritage and [complement] City redevelopment plans.

### III. Goal Components

1. Advise. Advise the City Council and other applicable City boards and commissions on all matters within the Commission's purview.
2. Inventory and Designate. Recommend, to the Planning and Zoning Commission, inclusion on the Tempe Historic Property Register. Identify, through inventory and assessment, methods, structures and localities where historic properties are imperiled, in order to ensure that alternatives to destruction are considered, and, use such methods to set preservation priorities and promote the identification and classification of properties that are eligible for historic designation.
3. Review. Review requests to alter, remodel, rebuild or otherwise develop designated properties. Review requests to demolish or remove a designated property.
4. Assist. Assist in making ownership of an historic property as beneficial as possible. Help by designating properties to the Tempe Register and assisting their owners to obtain incentives for preservation by rehabilitation, restoration or maintenance. Develop financial and other incentives with the City that will encourage the preservation of historic properties.
5. Educate. Increase public awareness among residents and businesses of the value of historic preservation. Promote education in Tempe history and historic properties in local schools.
6. Compile. Compile information about historic properties and the historic character of Tempe for the purpose of identifying structures, properties, districts and archaeological sites worthy of preservation. Share this information with boards, commissions, neighborhood and redevelopment planning efforts, as well as the general public, so that it may be considered in current and future development.

### IV. Policies

1. Prehistoric archaeological resources are of special concern to Native American groups. The City, represented by the Historic Preservation Officer and Commission, will consult with representatives of Native American tribes to identify concerns regarding the treatment of archaeological resources.
2. Preservation "in place" is the preferred outcome for the long-term management of historic properties. When this is not possible, relocation or documentation is the recommended alternative to preserve the historic characteristics of the property.
3. When the goals of the Historic Preservation Commission are in conflict with those of other boards, commissions, neighborhood or redevelopment planning efforts, a solution based on consensus and compromise (defined in a Memorandum of Understanding) is the preferred outcome.

### V. Conclusion

As set forth above, this is a plan of action to implement the Tempe Historic Preservation Ordinance, and a mission statement for the Tempe Historic Preservation Commission. Strategic goals will be developed by the Commission as part of an action plan.

### Accomplishments (Past 12 Months):

Accomplishments of the Historic Preservation Office and the Historic Preservation Commission for 2021 include:

**Cultural Resources Inventory and Blanket Archaeological Monitoring, Discovery, and Treatment Plan:** Preservation staff continued working with Logan Simpson to prepare a citywide cultural resources inventory and a blanket archaeological monitoring, discovery, and treatment plan. It is anticipated that both documents will be ready for Historic Preservation Commission and, subsequently, City Council review in early 2021.

**Governor's Heritage Preservation Honor Award:** The Tempe Historic Preservation Office, in addition to Hensel Phelps, Adobe Technology, LLC, and Motley Design Group, received a Governor's Heritage Preservation Honor Award for its role in the rehabilitation of the 1873-1924 Charles T. Hayden House, the oldest Euroamerican building in the Salt River Valley.

**Four Southern Tribes Cultural Resource Working Group Representation:** The Historic Preservation Commission recommended revising the City historic preservation ordinance to include permanent Four Southern Tribes Cultural Resource Working Group representation. The City Council subsequently voted to amend the historic preservation ordinance to ensure such representation. Reylynne Williams, a member of the Gila River Indian Community, was nominated for the seat by the Four Southern Tribes Cultural Resource Working Group; her nomination was confirmed by the City Council.

**Historic Preservation Plan / Historic Property Survey and Inventory:** Preservation staff continued working with Archaeological Consulting Services to prepare an historic property inventory and an historic preservation plan. The scope of work includes a pre-1961 inventory of commercial, industrial, and multi-family buildings in the Urban Core; a citywide inventory of properties constructed between 1961 – 1975, inclusive; and an updated historic preservation plan. The November 2021 Historic Preservation Commission agenda included commission consideration of the draft historic preservation plan.

**Land Acknowledgement Statement:** Preservation staff worked with the Four Southern Tribes to develop a land acknowledgement statement for the City of Tempe. The City Council passed the acknowledgement on January 14<sup>th</sup>, 2021 (R2021.08).

**Tempe Depot:** The Historic Preservation Office and Historic Preservation Commission worked with internal colleagues and RED Development to ensure the preservation and archaeological mitigation of the 1923 Fitzhugh & Byron-designed Tempe Depot, a resource not currently listed in the Tempe Historic Property Register. The building will be rehabilitated, added to the Tempe Historic Property Register, and subjected to façade and limited airspace conservation easements in association with an approved redevelopment of the property. The developer also committed to data testing and, if needed, data recovery. Logan Simpson completed this work in October 2021.

#### Goals Related to City Council Strategic Priorities, if Applicable (Next 12 Months):

**Goal:** Complete an historic property survey and inventory, an update to the Tempe Historic Preservation Plan and, if necessary, revise the City's historic preservation ordinance to address gaps and opportunities identified in the revised historic preservation plan

The City engaged Archaeological Consulting Services, Ltd. (ACS) for the "Preparation of a Historic Property Survey and Inventory and a Historic Preservation Plan". Despite COVID-19-related delays caused by restricted access to relevant archives and limited opportunities for Tribal consultation meetings and public meetings, among other challenges, it is anticipated that the deliverables will be complete or substantially complete by the end of 2021. The Scope of Services includes three tasks, those being:

##### Task 1: Urban Core Pre-1961 Inventory

An inventory of pre-1961 commercial, industrial, and multi-family housing properties be inventoried within the Urban Core that pre-date 1961 (the beginning date of inventory for the original RFO). All properties pre-dating 1961 located within the Urban Core, with the exception of single-family residential and Arizona State University (ASU) properties, will be inventoried and assessed for National Register of Historic Places (National Register) eligibility. This inventory will include previously

Commented [SA1]: Need to update the status of these things and we are good.

evaluated properties to ensure that their eligibility has not changed since the original documentation. All properties will be coded by property type and eligibility using GIS.

#### Task 2: Inventory and Research for 1961 – 1975 Properties

ACS will conduct a survey and inventory of individual properties (buildings, structures, and objects) and potential residential districts constructed between 1961 and 1975. The survey and inventory will locate representative styles within residential neighborhoods. This method allows us to capture the architectural styles, identify significance of those neighborhoods, and assess general integrity. Detailed information regarding character-defining features, circulation patterns, and number of contributors/noncontributors will not be collected for this study. Documentation of properties recommended eligible will be consistent with that prepared for the Historic Eligible classification used by the City: Historic Property Inventory Forms and Update Forms will not be required, although details regarding significance, integrity, and National Register eligibility will be provided. Properties recommended not eligible will be presented in a table with justification for the recommendation. All properties will be coded by property type and eligibility using GIS.

#### Task 3: Historic Preservation Plan

Based on previous experience and using other plans prepared for Salt River Valley cities as a guide, ACS anticipates the City's historic preservation plan will include the following sections:

1. Regulatory Contexts
2. Summary of Prehistoric and Historic Contexts and Tempe Resources
3. Tribal Perspective
4. Preservation Program
5. Planning Considerations

Regulatory contexts will include discussion of federal, state, and municipal laws that apply to projects conducted within City limits, as well as the responsibilities of the City as a Certified Local Government (CLG). A summary of prehistoric and historic contexts will be presented. These will be brief but include examples of relevant historic property types in Tempe, as well as important aspects of integrity and significance for each property type. An annotated bibliography will be prepared to provide readers with references for large historic property studies and summaries. A tribal perspectives component will be prepared and included in the plan (please see detailed scope below). A discussion will follow regarding the current historic preservation program in Tempe. This section will include reference to the HPO and City process documents, as well as National Register designations, the local property register, Historic Eligible properties, applications and internal City processes, and the role of the HPC. Finally, planning considerations will be presented. This section will include historic preservation considerations with reference to historic preservation elements from the 2040 Plan, Urban Core Master Plan components, and recent Character Area development. This section of the plan will also provide goals and priorities, as identified by staff, consulting agencies, stakeholders, and the public regarding historic preservation in Tempe and how those will fit into the City's short-term and long-range planning. Finally, the plan will include recommendations to help formalize these priorities into the City's planning process. These recommendations will be prepared in consultation with the City Historic Preservation Officer and Project Manager.

The preparation of the plan has included extensive Tribal and public outreach.

Updating the City's historic preservation plan and revising the historic preservation ordinance aligns with Council priorities two (... emphasizing the importance of open government, customer service and communication with community members...), three (... investment in neighborhoods, parks, the arts, human services, and city amenities...), and four (... sustainable growth and development strategies...).

**Goal: Complete a citywide Cultural Resources Inventory and Blanket Archaeological Monitoring, Discovery, and Treatment Plan**

The City engaged Logan Simpson to prepare a citywide Cultural Resources Inventory and Blanket Archaeological Monitoring, Discovery, and Treatment Plan. Despite COVID-19-related delays caused by restricted access to relevant archives and limited opportunities for Tribal consultation meetings and public meetings, among other challenges, it is anticipated that the deliverables will be complete or substantially complete by the end of 2021. The Scope of Services includes a Planning Phase and a Working Phase. Tasks associated with each phase follow:

Planning Phase Services:

- Provide detailed independent knowledge of known archaeological sites within Tempe and the Salt River Valley;
- Provide detailed independent knowledge of monitoring and discovery plans and Arizona State Museum / Arizona State Historic Preservation Office / Section 106 / Section 4(f) submittal, review, and approval procedures;
- Identify key general stakeholder groups; and
- Provide project planning, scheduling, and execution, including at least four meetings with representatives of the Four Southern Tribes and other communities claiming ancestral affiliation with the Tempe, two general stakeholder meetings, and two Historic Preservation Commission meetings.

Working Phase Services:

- A Cultural Resources Inventory inclusive of known archaeological sites, prehistoric canals and Traditional Cultural Properties;
- GIS maps (for internal use only) related to the items above;
- At least four meetings with representatives of the Four Southern Tribes and other communities claiming ancestral affiliation with the Tempe area
- At least two meetings with key general stakeholder groups identified in the Planning Phase;
- Two meetings with the Historic Preservation Commission; and
- Delivery of a Cultural Resources Inventory and Blanket Monitoring, Discovery, and Treatment Plan, crafted with input from City staff, the Four Southern Tribes, general stakeholders, and the Historic Preservation Commission.

Fulfillment of City responsibilities and compliance with all applicable cultural / historic resource laws, regulations, and agreements aligns with Council priorities number one (... commitment to... justice), two (... emphasizing the importance of open government...), three (... emphasis on equity), and four (... sustainable growth and development strategies...).