



Sustainability Commission

MEETING DATE

Monday, October 18, 2021 3:30 p.m.

MEETING LOCATION - Virtual Meeting Microsoft Teams meeting

Click here to join the meeting

Or call in (audio only)

<u>+1 480-498-8745,,351150424#</u> United States, Phoenix

Phone Conference ID: 351 150 424#

AGENDA ITEM	PRESENTER	ACTION or INFORMATION
1. Public Appearances The Sustainability Commission welcomes public comment for items listed on this agenda. There is a three-minute time limit per citizen.	Kendon Jung, Commission Chair (3:30 – 3:33 pm)	Information
2. Approval of Meeting Minutes The Commission will be asked to review and approve meeting minutes from the September 20, 2021 meeting.	Kendon Jung, Commission Chair (3:33 – 3:35 pm)	Action
3. Climate Action Plan Update Staff will provide updates.	Braden Kay, Sustainability Director (3:35–4:00 pm)	Action
4. Sustainability and Livability Council Committee Staff will provide updates.	Braden Kay, Sustainability Director (4:00 – 4:20 pm)	Action
5. Sustainability & Resilience Policy Update Staff will provide updates.	Braden Kay, Sustainability Director (4:20–4:30 pm)	Action
6. Sustainability & Resilience FY 22-23 Budget Staff will provide updates.	Braden Kay, Sustainability Director (4:30–4:40 pm)	Action
7. Commission Retreat Staff will provide updates.	Kendon Jung, Commission Chair (4:40 – 5:00 pm)	Action
8. Annual Report Staff will provide updates.	Kendon Jung, Commission Chair (5:00 – 5:10 pm)	Action
9. Housekeeping Items	Kendon Jung, Commission Chair (5:10 – 5:20 pm)	Action
10. Future Agenda Items Commission may request future agenda items.	Kendon Jung, Commission Chair (5:20 – 5:30 pm)	Action

According to the Arizona Open Meeting Law, the Sustainability Commission may only discuss matters listed on the agenda. The City of Tempe endeavors to make all public meetings accessible to persons with disabilities. With 48 hours advance notice, special assistance is available at public meetings for sight and/or hearing-impaired persons. Please call 350-2775 (voice) or 350-8400 (TDD) to request an accommodation to participate in a public meeting.



Minutes City of Tempe Sustainability Commission September 20, 2021

Minutes of the Tempe Sustainability Commission meeting held on Monday, September 20 2021, 4:30 p.m. at a virtual meeting on MS Teams, through City Hall, 31 E. 5th Street, Tempe, Arizona.

(MEMBERS) Present:

Kendon Jung (Chair) Barbie Burke (Vice Chair) Steven Russell Jake Swanson John Kane Ryan Mores Gretchen Reinhart

(MEMBERS) Absent:

Stephanie Milam-Edwards Katja Brundiers

City Staff Present:

Braden Kay Grace DelMonte Kelly Henry Pearson Terry Piekarz

Guests Present:

Chair Jung called the meeting to order at 4:34 p.m.

Agenda Item 1 - Public Appearances

Chair Jung asked the guests to introduce themselves. No public appearances were made.

Agenda Item 2 - Approval of Meeting Minutes

Chair Jung introduced the minutes of the August 23,2021 meeting. Vice Chair Burke made a motion to approve the minutes. Commissioner Russell seconded.

Motion: Vice Chair Burke **Second:** Commissioner Russell

Decision: Approved 6-0

Voted to Approve: Kendon Jung (Chair) Barbie Burke (Vice Chair) Gretchen Reinhardt Steve Russell Ryan Mores John Kane

Motion Passed 6-0. Commissioner Swanson abstained as this is his first meeting.

Agenda Item 3 – Solid Waste Rate Study and Diversion Goals

Terry Piekarz presented an update on the Solid Waste Study Recommendations and Diversion Goals. Terry said the expenditure for the waste program is \$20.8 million dollars, and the net revenue requirement is \$19.7 million dollars. The current revenue is \$19.4 million dollars, meaning an extra \$300,000 dollars is needed, starting in 2022. This will require a levelized rate increase of 3% per year. An update will be completed next year to determine if rate increases are necessary. The rate adjustments may be higher or lower than 3%.

Overall, 92% of residential solid waste customers receive trash and recycling services, up to 96 gallons each. There will be a 75-cent price increase for these customers, and the utility must charge for additional containers.

Garbage disposal and recycling services account for 70% of the rates. The Municipal Utility Department wishes to allow wholesale of compost to maximize cost recovery. Compost can be discounted for Tempe customers. The opportunity exists to partner with municipalities or private entities to deliver compost to the community.

Commercial Services rates will change. The utility will decrease multiple container discount by 5%. It will also change frontload recycling services to volume-based rates.

Landfill diversion can be enhanced by dispersing educational materials, holding zero waste day events, and collecting green organics for compost and commingled container recycling. The goal is to achieve 25% citywide diversion. In 2020, 23% of waste was diverted. In 2021, 17.6% was diverted. This is a result of increased volume of garbage during COVID and resource constraints.

On October 14th the rate adjustments will be proposed and become effective in January 2022.

Commissioner Questions/Comments:

- What options do you have for piloting food waste collection? More staff/money? Terry said there are no plans to pilot food waste programs at this time. Programs require larger scale. They lack personnel and land to stage operation. This is something that has come up but no plans to pursue.
- You mentioned obstacles are human capital and land? Phoenix has compost facility on 27th Avenue. Could
 this serve as a collection point? Terry said they are focusing on bolstering core business, improving current
 functionality. The 27th Avenue facility was examined from a transportation cost standpoint in the feasibility
 study and we will continue to explore it. City partnership is the best option. Council must direct the
 department and provide resources.
- Residents have questions about food waste recycling. There is a vision of bringing 10s of millions of
 infrastructure and developing a large facility that enables waste diversion. If we don't have a pilot project, we
 cannot divert food waste. 30% of waste stream. What would it take int order to add staff/money to improve
 recycling rates and gauge interest in a food waste pilot? Terry said we understand why diversion numbers
 are down. There is a volume increase, vacancies, and hiring challenges. We would need an indication from
 council that staff look at the feasibility. Could be a public comment from Commission to Council or could
 come from council committees.
- Chair Jung requested a report of the waste stream characterization.
- Could you say more about expected rate changes if market-based pricing for compost. Assumed that price
 would go up, what would the cost level increase be? Terry said looking at the ability to go from pilot pricing,

from close to free, to subsidized through other rates. We are able to look at market pricing and set prices based on commercial rates or prices at home-improvement stores. Pricing would be somewhat similar if slightly less than retail. Pricing can be set but discounted for customers. We package compost to increase accessibility to customers.

• Chair Jung requested information on waste diversion and the ability of the city to reduce contamination. He requested Terry's team return to the commission with a roadmap for solid waste diversion for single family homes and waste stream characterization, and plan to address materials in waste stream.

Sustainability Direct Braden Kay asked Terry if staff feels that the budget is adequate to reach goals? Would additional expenditure in recycling outreach be necessary? Terry said sound utility management practices can help us achieve the goal. COVID and deployment of resources have caused the slow-down. Resource prioritization will help efficiency. We have one of the best recycling programs in the valley and one of the lowest contamination rates. Time and consistent management will get us to the diversion rate we need. Chair Jung said the Commission thinks the that compost pilot should remain in place. What do you need to implement this program? Terry said direction from council is clear. It is a matter of utility management. Changes and improvements are ongoing. Mayor and Council made expectations clear.

Agenda Item 4 - Climate Action Plan Updates

Sustainability Director Braden Kay said that two sessions were given last Tuesday on the Climate Action Plan. They reviewed Actions, Partnerships, and Highlight Actions of the Climate Action Plan. There are four stakeholder groups prioritized in the update.

Business:

Local First Arizona gave an agenda update last week. Braden presented to the Chamber of Commerce Sustainability Committee. There is a new group of stakeholders in the chamber who we need to get invested in the sustainability agenda. They are focusing on energy efficiency and water conservation, as well as green stormwater infrastructure. They wish to increase quality of business-city partnerships. Budget allotments allow us to engage business community on electric vehicles. While the plan is going to council, we will already be working with Local First and the Chamber of Commerce on vehicle electrification.

There have been criticisms of the business agenda as too basic and not innovative. We need to get the bread and butter business engagement done. We are doing exactly what the businesses asked for. We have excellent partnerships in the business community. Mobility Hubs are an important part of the business agenda.

Climate Justice:

There will be two more meetings in October with target neighborhoods.

Commissioner Questions and Comments:

• It is challenging and cost-intensive to engage neighborhoods, and it must be done on the ground. We have to ask the right questions. For example, the Escalante neighborhood needs a safe route to school. This challenge is multi-faceted, including issues of redlining and equity. We are paying partners to get input when they aren't asking the right questions of residents is an issue. Transportation infrastructure underserves communities of color and low-income residents. One specific issue is transportation to McClintock High. The current option is only large roads which are unsafe to bike on. The lack of a railroad crossing makes this problem difficult. Unlimited Potential needs to incorporate these issues into their community engagement.

Braden said that they are focused on heat awareness, land stewardship, community-based organization partnerships transit, housing, food, and Envision Tempe, an upcoming community resilience hub. Unlimited Potential is hosting events for community feedback about Envision.

Neighborhood Agenda

They are focused on heat resilience, equity issues, community-based partnerships, and resilient energy and mobility hubs. They have generally the same themes as the climate justice stakeholders, with a slightly different focus.

Youth

Young people are actively engaged in local food and food access. They want to see composting at schools, food waste programs, and school gardens. Budget requests can be done for these.

Youth are also focused on transportation equity and tree canopy. They want to have the Office of Sustainability support schools in moving forward their own climate action. They are also interested in green infrastructure, such as stormwater capture, shade canopies, and urban cooling. There are opportunities for pilot projects to integrate these measures in schools.

Youth are concerned about mobility hubs. Many aren't available for those under 18 or low-income people who cannot afford to access them. The city must provide affordable options and those accessible to all ages and groups.

Feedback is being integrated into draft. It will be published in December and face final approval in the winter. An online forum is open for feedback until Sept. 28th.

Commissioner Questions:

So many businesses moving here, for example Deloitte. They have sustainability offices. Is there an
opportunity for partnership there? Braden said yes, we are in contact with the economic development
office. Hadn't heard about Deloitte but we could make a connection there.

Chair Jung called on Braden for next Agenda item.

Agenda Item 5 – Sustainability and Livability Council Committee

The committee is focused on the four highlight actions. They recently had APS and SRP come to talk about solar and battery programs. They are asking for updates on how city can reach renewable energy goals.

An International Green Construction Code presentation is coming to the committee in one of the next meetings. There is interest in Tempe adopting the EV-ready code and solar-ready code, which Tucson recently adopted. Engagement has to be done with business community on this.

The September meeting will have an update about green stormwater infrastructure. They are meeting with consultants that worked with Lake Havasu on green stormwater infrastructure, to see whether Tempe can have something like that.

Braden asked who his liaison for green building codes were. Chair Jung said Commissioners Kane and Burke are the commission liaisons.

The next green stormwater infrastructure pilot project is on Saturday, October 23. Is it a volunteer day to put in bioswales, landscapes, and native plants.

Sustainable building policy is anticipated to be approved by council this winter.

Agenda Item 6 – Sustainability and Resilience Policy Update

Braden gave an update and said the only thing to add is Tempe is working on regional policy to develop regional resilience in Maricopa County, with an update coming soon.

They are also working with federal policy and are having a joint event with Arizona Forward and Sustainable Cities Network and Congressman Stanton. Braden invited members of the Council. Chair Jung asked Braden to send invitations to council. A letter was signed by cities regarding regional resilience, Braden will send the letter to the council.

Agenda Item 7 – Housekeeping items

Chair Jung said Annual Report is being drafted for review. It will come to the Commission in draft form in October. Feedback will be due in November. The finalized document will be sent to Council to be included in their end of year Annual Reports in December.

Council is thrilled that the Race to Zero recommendations earlier this fall were passed. In addition, the commission name change and office name change, will be passed in October.

Chair Jung introduced a new commissioner, Jake Swanson. He will fill the business position. Jake worked with Local First Arizona and is a graduate of School of Sustainability. His first sustainability aha moment was working in communities and seeing the relationships in communities; seeing which communities were effective and ineffective. He identified with those communities in his childhood. Seeing the community around him working for the betterment of others inspired him.

Commissioner Russell is moving to Colorado and wanted to thank the commission. He has been on the commission for 2.5 years. He wants to know what is needed to aid in the transition.

Chair Jung said that Commissioner Russell will be greatly missed and thanked him for his time on the commission.

Agenda Item 8 – Future Agenda Items

Commissioner Reinhardt wanted to express the importance of the early workshop meetings and thinking about prioritization in a retreat context. She encourages the commission to hold a workshop and determine new goals.

Chair Jung asked for a motion to adjourn.

Motion: Commissioner Russell Second: Vice Chair Burke Decision: Approved 7-0

Voted to Approve:

Kendon Jung (Chair)
Barbie Burke (Vice Chair)
Gretchen Reinhardt
Steve Russell
Ryan Mores
John Kane
Jake Swanson

The meeting was adjourned at 4:51 pm.

Prepared by: Henry Pearson Reviewed by: Grace DeMonte Kelly

SUSTAINABILITY COMMISSION 2021 ANNUAL REPORT -



Description as Defined in Ordinance:

The Tempe sustainability commission shall have the following powers and duties:

- (1) To research, advise, and recommend to the city council policies and programs that advance sustainability in Tempe, with particular attention to sustainability in the following areas:
- a. Energy management (city operations and the city as a whole);
- b. Climate-action plan with a roadmap of actions to be recommended;
- c. Local food and agriculture;
- d. Livable neighborhoods and happy communities;
- e. Land use and development;
- f. Building practices;
- g. Purchasing practices;
- h. Economic development (green jobs);
- i. Solid waste, recycling, and hazardous waste;
- j. Water and wastewater management;
- k. Transportation;
- I. Dark skies;
- m. Air quality;
- n. Environmental justice; and as of June 2015
- o. Preparedness and resiliency.
- (2) Assist city departments in executing approved policies and programs;
- (3) To support education and outreach related to the city's sustainability practices;
- (4) To identify potential sustainability partnerships with public, private and educational entities; and
- (5) To recommend for city council consideration a comprehensive sustainability plan with measurable goals and benchmarks to ensure year-to-year progress. (Ord. No. O2015.24, 6-25-15)

TCC § {City Code, Chapter 2, Article V, Division 21 }

List of Board and Commission Members, Including Attendance and Service Dates:

Board/Commission Members:	Service Dates:	Attendance Record:
Kendon, Jung	12/31/2021	Attended x meetings out of 11
Mores, Ryan	12/31/2021	Attended x meetings out of 11
Kane, John	12/31/2021	Attended x meetings out of 11
Reinhardt, Gretchen	12/31/2021	Attended x meetings out of 11
Milam-Edwards, Stephanie	12/31/2021	Attended x meetings out of 11
Burke, Barbie	12/31/2021	Attended x meetings out of 11
Russell, Steven	12/31/2021	Attended x meetings out of 11
Jahnke, Sukki	12/31/2021	Attended x meetings out of 11
Brundiers, Katja	12/31/2021	Attended x meetings out of 11
Melis, Anna	12/31/2021	Attended x meetings out of 11
Swanson, Jake	12/31/2021	Attended x meetings out of 11

Name of Chair and Vice Chair:

- Chair Kendon Jung
- Vice Chair Ryan Mores (1/1/21 8/22/21)
- Vice Chair Barbie Burke (8/23 12/31/21)

Staff Liaisons and Contact Information:

Staff Liaisons:	Department:	Phone:	<u>Email:</u>
Braden Kay	Office of Sustainability	480-350-8867	Braden kay@tempe.gov
Grace DelMonte Kelly	Engineering and	480-350-8369	Grace_kelly@tempe.gov
	Transportation		

Meeting Frequency and Location:

Meetings in 2021 were virtual meetings. In the past, meetings were typically held the third Monday of the month at 4:30 p.m. at 31 E. Fifth Street, Engineering & Transportation Conference Room, Tempe, AZ 85281. In 2021, eleven virtual meetings were held.

Number of Meetings Cancelled and Reason for Cancellation:

July meeting was cancelled for summer vacation.

Vacancies and Duration of Vacancies:

Four vacancies occurred in 2021.

Subcommittee and Subcommittee Activity:

Did the Board/Commission have any subcommittees active during the reporting period? ☐ YES ☒ NO

Mission Statement:

The mission statement of the Sustainability Commission is to be a culture-catalyst to provide leadership, education, and guidance on sustainability programs and policies to City Council and for our entire community to transform Tempe into a healthy and resilient city that inspires the region, the nation and world.

Accomplishments (Past 12 Months):

Since the passing of Tempe's first Climate Action Plan in November 2019, the Sustainability Commission has been working with staff to guide the implementation of the highlight actions in the plan: resilient energy hubs, transportation demand management, green infrastructure standards and the adoption of the international green construction code. The Commission also accomplished the following:

- Supported the Climate Acton Plan 2022 Update planning to ensure the update to the plan allows Tempe businesses
 and residents to have tangible actions to partner with the City to create a citywide movement to reduce carbon
 emissions and become more resilient to extreme heat. The Commission's work included advising staff on and
 attending six listening sessions with the following stakeholder groups:
 - Tempe businesses co-hosted by the Tempe Chamber of Commerce
 - Tempe built environment professionals co-hosted by John Kane
 - Tempe social justice leaders including the Equity in Action Coalition
 - Tempe youth including members of MYAC and Library Teen Program
 - Tempe faith-based community
 - Tempe neighborhoods and the General Public
- Supported the advancement of important sustainability investments in the City of Tempe
 - Transportation Demand Management
 - Solid Waste Rate Study

- International Green Construction Code
- Resilient Energy Hub/EnVision Resilience Hub
- Parks and Recreation Master Plan
- Supported the Office of Sustainability in implementing and obtaining grant resources to advance climate and sustainability goals. Grants implemented include:
 - Pew Charitable Trust Health Impact Project to use heat and health data to inform infrastructure decisions in multi-use bike paths, playgrounds, parking lots and arterial walls (Implemented)
 - GLOCULL grant to advance equitable and inclusive food systems in which city staff produce the Arizona Indigenous Foodways 2020 Yearbook (Implemented)
 - Healthy Urban Environments grant with Arizona State University to use heat and health data to support creation of a urban cooling plan for the City of Tempe (Ongoing)
 - Cool Kids, Cool Places, Cool Futures grant from the Robert Wood Johnson Foundation to create Youth Councils in the Escalante and Gilliland neighborhoods to advance resilience and build a citywide and regional movement for urban forestry, cool materials, and heat relief. (Received)
 - National Endowment for the Arts Our Town grant to fund Wanda Dalla Costa and the Indigenous Design Collaborative to create a Indigenous Design Manual to incorporate indigenous knowledge and perspectives in the Tempe's built environment (Pending)
- Guided Office of Sustainability in creating green recovery strategy to ensure sustainability and resilience are embedded into the COVID-19 recovery efforts. This included supporting the Mayor and Council funding:
 - Energy Equity Pilot Project to support residents in reducing their energy cost burden and learning ways to reduce energy costs
 - Equitable and Inclusive Climate Action: Resources to ensure that Tempe's climate justice efforts support and engage residents with low incomes and small businesses
- Held a joint Sustainability Commission and Neighborhood Advisory Commission Meeting to discuss:
 - Climate Action Plan Update neighborhood engagement
 - Cool Kids, Cool Places, Cool Futures Grant

Goals Related to City Council Strategic Priorities, if Applicable (Next 12 Months):

<u>Council Priority</u>: Implementing sustainable growth and development strategies, including improving Tempe's public transit system to meet future needs, by actively seeking innovative technologies and leading the way in creating a more sustainable community.

Climate Action Policy

The Commission seeks to support Mayor, Council and city staff in passing climate action policy that moves forward the implementation of the Climate Action Plan including: resilient energy hubs, transportation demand management and mobility hubs, electric vehicles and electric vehicle infrastructure, green stormwater infrastructure standards and the adoption of the international green construction code. We would like to see the Mayor and Council pass a suite of policies in 2022 and invest in the Climate Action Plan through the budget process that will be finalized in June of 2022.

Climate Action Plan 2022 Update

The Commission will support city staff across departments in completing the Climate Action 2022 that will engage the critical stakeholder groups including, youth, ASU students, businesses, built environmental professionals, the faith-based community, neighborhoods, social justice leaders, and the general public. The update will include new community and municipal Greenhouse Gas Emissions Inventories and actions that each target group want to complete with the city.

Sustainable and Resilient Recovery Efforts

The Commission will support city staff in implementing recovery efforts including:

- EnVision Resilience Hub on Apache, including opportunities to add solar, energy efficiency technology and refrigeration
- Energy Equity Pilot Project
- Equitable and inclusive engagement in the Climate Action Plan Update focused on small businesses and residents with low incomes
- Efforts to close the digital divide starting with members of the Cool Kids project

Grant Implementation (HUE and Cool Kids) and Grant Attraction (NSF, DOE, USDA, FEMA)

The Commission will support city staff in guiding the implementation of existing grants including Healthy Urban Environments and the Cools Kids grant. The Commission will also support the staff in seeking Federal grants including the National Science Foundation, Department of Energy, Department of Agriculture, and the Federal Emergency Management Administration.

More consistent communication and joint activity with Council and other Commissions

The Sustainability Commission is dedicated to more consistently coordinating with Mayor and Council and other Commissions. The Commission fully supports the creation of a Council Committee on Carbon Neutrality and Resilience that would include emissions reductions in transportation, energy, water conservation, resilience to extreme heat and urban forestry.

The Commission also plans to do joint meetings with the Transportation Commission, Neighborhood Advisory Committee, Human Relations Commission, Preserve and Open Space Commission and the Parks Board. The Sustainability Commission firmly believes that boards and commissions should coordinate efforts to advance the city's performance measures and priority areas.