

DRAFT MINUTES HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION MAY 19, 2021

Minutes of the regular hearing of the Historic Preservation Commission, of the City of Tempe, which was held virtually.

Regular Meeting 6:04 PM

Present:	Staff:
Chuck Buss, Chair	Steve Abrahamson, Principal Planner
Chris Garraty	Brittainy Nelson, Administrative Assistant
Jim Garrison	Alex Smith, Deputy Dir. Special Projects
Gregory Larson	Jared Smith, Senior Curator
Laurene Montero	John Southard, Historic Preservation Officer
Joe Nucci	

1) Voting of the Meeting Minutes

Motion by Commissioner **Larson** to approve the Meeting Minutes of April 14, 2021 ; second by Commissioner **Garrison**. Motion passed on **6-0** vote.

Ayes: Chuck Buss, Chris Garraty, Jim Garrison, Gregory Larson, Laurene Montero, Joe Nucci

Nays: None

Abstain: None

Absent: Matthew Bilsbarrow, Martin Ball, Elizabeth Gilbert

2) Request for a Certificate of Appropriateness for repainting the TEMPE NATIONAL BANK, located at 526 South Mill Avenue

Presentation by Staff, John Southard, Historic Preservation Officer

Mr. Southard informed the Commissioners that the Tempe National Bank is listed in the Historic Property Register and is subject to a façade conservation easement. The current occupant Charles Trumbull would like to repaint the building a light grey and dark grey. The staff recommendation is approval with conditions. The conditions being that if there are changes to what was submitted to the applicant the changes would need to be improved by the Historic Preservation Officer. Non-painted historic materials, as identified by the Historic Preservation Officer prior to permit issuance, shall not be painted.

Commission Discussion

Chair Buss asked Mr. Southard if the applicant was in attendance.

Mr. Southard stated that they were sent the information however they are not in attendance at the moment.

Chair Buss stated that he did look at the paint colors and they are not a big issue. Sometime over the last 15 years the owner of the business has made changes to the outside of the building and areas around the building. The work was not presented to the Commission.

Mr. Southard stated that is correct. There have been some alterations to the building there is not a complete list yet. But there were things done with the stairs, railing, ADA ramp and other things completed without a certificate of no effect or certificate of appropriateness.

Chair Buss asked if that is something that can be addressed with the owner at some point.

Mr. Southard stated that he can prepare of listing of changes that were not approved under the ordinance or the façade conservation easement and bring it to the commission for discussion. And ajenized it and send a request or invitation to a future meeting.

Commissioner Nucci asked if there was something specific that may be in harm's way.

Mr. Southard stated that the exposed Tempe National Bank stone. There is also an area off to the Southside of the sign that is exposed and is not currently painted.

Commissioner Nucci suggested that they gather signatures from the owner and the contractor so that they don't miss it.

Mr. Southard stated that he is not sure what actions can be taken and asked that Mr. Smith give some information on the matter.

Mr. Smith stated that the conservation easement is a contractual requirement. Therefor the City has the right to send the owner a letter to sign. Signing the affidavit with the permits is not something that the City does however a letter prepared from the Historic Preservation Officer with explicit directions of what not to paint would be the best option.

Mr. Abrahamson stated that he will be writing an approval letter as soon as commission gives the go ahead and he will add any conditions that is needed.

Commissioner Nucci stated Move for conditional approval of a request to repaint the Tempe National Bank building located at 526 South Mill Avenue subject to conditions 1 and 2 as stated in the Staff Summary Report dated 05/11/2021 and owner and contractor to acknowledge in writing areas not to be painted (PL210089).

Chair Buss asked if the areas painted are to acknowledge by the Historic Preservation Officer.

Mr. Nucci stated that can added for clarity.

Chair Buss also asked if the owner or representative to come to the next meeting to discuss exterior changes at some point would that need to be a condition of approval.

Mr. Southard stated that he is not sure that it relates to the item at hand. However, the invitation that the chair extends would be in their best interest to respond to it.

Mr. Smith stated that the work was approved by the City of Tempe Community Development department. So, the applicant did go through a permitting process and received approval to do so. What Mr. Southard put in the report was to make sure that they came to the Commission in good faith that the work was done. The suggestion could be that the next time there is remodel to the building those items should be addressed. Not sure it something that can go in the letter of approval. However, with the façade easement contract that point can be made since it is in violation of the façade easement.

Mr. Southard stated that to be clear the Historic Preservation office did not give the ok. However, Community Development did.

Chair Buss called for a motion:

Motion by Commissioner **Nucci** to approve the request to repaint the Tempe National Bank building located at 526 South Mill Avenue subject to conditions 1 and 2 as stated in the Staff Summary Report dated 05/11/2021 and owner and contractor to acknowledge areas not to be painted per direction of HPO; second by Commissioner **Garrison**. Motion passed on **6-0** vote.

Ayes: Chuck Buss, Chris Garraty, Jim Garrison, Gregory Larson, Laurene Montero, Joe Nucci

Nays: None

Abstain: None

Absent: Matthew Bilsbarrow, Martin Ball, Elizabeth Gilbert

- 3) Discussion and possible action regarding initiating the Tempe Historic Property Register listing process for certain City-owned parcels located in the NW ¼ of Section 23 T1N R4E

Presentation by Staff, John Southard, Historic Preservation Officer

Mr. Southard informed the commissioners that the properties in the NW section reference the former railroad alignment of 8th Street. There are no standing buildings however there are features that are still in existence. That were identified by Logan Simpson during the course of the 8th Street Multi use path phase I and II archaeological work. The Four Southern Tribes believe this location to be a traditional cultural property with a location of ongoing cultural sensitivity. The ideal is not so much to list it as a recognition but as a protection. A listing would require any proposed work to that area to be reviewed and proposed to the Historic Preservation Office or Commission. Based on the nature of the work. In time there may be induced internal awareness. Listing it in the Historic Property register would ensure that it is not the case. It is eligible under criteria A community development and D information potential.

Commission Discussion

Commissioner Garraty stated that to be listed on the Historic Property Register it has to be City property.

Mr. Southard stated that it does not need to be City property. It would be a recommendation to City Leadership.

Commissioner Montero asked what the A criteria was.

Mr. Southard stated that the Railroad Corridor had been referred to as the Creamy Branch was identified as eligible for listing under criteria A which is community development. It was not recommended under criteria C because there was some loss of integrity not the matter of materials but the Corridor itself. Should there be a recommendation then the justification would be that of a multi component of archaeological and prehistoric.

Commissioner Montero stated that the D criteria is unique and has information potential.

Mr. Southard stated that the office is always open for input of the Four Southern Tribes.

Commissioner Larson asked for clarification that section 23 and 16 are some distance apart from each other and would like to know which section is where. Section 16 seems to be closer to Devils Advocate.

Mr. Southard informed them that the property in section 23 Northwest corner is Rural and University. Which is the 8th street property. The former railroad alignment and the Devils Advocate parcel. The section 16 is the Gonzales-Martinez house.

Chair Buss called for a motion:

Motion by Commissioner **Montero** to recommend approval that the resource be brought to the City Council as being eligible for the City register under A for the Railroad and D the Hohokam big house. For the City Council to nominate the property to the Tempe Historic Property register; second by Commissioner **Garrison**. Motion passed on **6-0** vote.

Ayes: Chuck Buss, Chris Garraty, Jim Garrison, Gregory Larson, Laurene Montero, Joe Nucci

Nays: None

Abstain: None

Absent: Matthew Bilsbarrow, Martin Ball, Elizabeth Gilbert

- 4) Discussion and possible action regarding initiating the Tempe Historic Property Register listing process for certain City-owned parcels located in the NE ¼ of Section 16 T1N R4E

Presentation by Staff, John Southard, Historic Preservation Officer

Mr. Southard informed the commissioners that this property is in relation to the Gonzalez-Martinez House. It is the small Adobe home immediately West of the railroad tracks and North of 1st street. It is the third oldest building in the Valley the second oldest in Tempe. Only the Hayden House is older the property is classified Historic eligibility is also listed in the National register of Historic Places that the Commission is likely aware of the lengthy dispute of ownership that has now been settled. It is in the Cities name and physical possession. As such there is a need to discuss the historic classified property.

Chair Buss called for a motion:

Motion by Commissioner **Larson** to recommend approval to the City Council to include Gonzalez-Martinez House on the Tempe Historic Property register; second by Commissioner **Montero**. Motion passed on **6-0** vote.

Ayes: Chuck Buss, Chris Garraty, Jim Garrison, Gregory Larson, Laurene Montero, Joe Nucci

Nays: None

Abstain: None

Absent: Matthew Bilsbarrow, Martin Ball, Elizabeth Gilbert

- 5) Chair / Staff Updates

Presentation by Staff, John Southard, Historic Preservation Officer

Mr. Southard informed the Commissioners that the representation of the Four Southern Tribes Cultural resource working group on the commission has come about. At this point the Four Southern Tribes has been asked to nominate a representative and then the nomination will be acted on by the City Council. Commissioner Bilsbarrow had to step down but that does allow for immediate representation of the Four Southern Tribes working group.

The Gonzalez-Martinez house the emergency stabilization work has begun. There was soil developed to the property about a week ago. Dirt was tested to make sure that it was appropriate for usage. The water is turned on so that work can began.

In November of 2020 there was a request to demolish the First Congregational Church. The commission denied the request and following there was a 6 month stay of demolition. The six months stay ended on May 17, 2021. At this point should the property owner wish they could obtain a permit without Historic Preservation Review. Issues were addressed by the subcommittee and it still stands.

Hearing adjourned at 6:46pm

Prepared by: Brittainy Nelson, Administrative Assistant
Reviewed by:

Steve Abrahamson, Principal Planner

SA:bn

DRAFT