

# MINUTES HISTORIC PRESERVATION COMMISSION MAY13, 2020

Minutes of the regular hearing of the Historic Preservation commission, of the City of Tempe, which was held at the Tempe City Hall - Council Chambers, 31 E 5<sup>th</sup> Street, Tempe, Arizona.

## Regular Meeting 6:12 PM

<b>Present:</b>	<b>Staff:</b>
Chuck Buss, Chair	Steve Abrahamson, Principal Planner
Martin Ball, Vice-Chair	John Southard, Historic Preservation Officer
Chris Garraty	Brittainy Nelson, Administrative Assistant
Jim Garrison	Alex Smith, Dep Com Dev Dir – Special Projects
Elizabeth Gilbert	
Gregory Larson	
Joe Nucci	

### 1) Voting of the Meeting Minutes

**Motion** by Vice Chair Ball to approve the Meeting Minutes of February 12, 2020; second by Commissioner Gilbert. Motion passed on 6-0 vote.

**Ayes:** Chuck Buss, Martin Ball, Chris Garraty, Elizabeth Gilbert, Gregory Larosn, Joe Nucci

**Nays:** None

**Abstain:** None

**Absent:** Matthew Bilsbarrow, Jim Garrison, Laurence Montero

- 2) Request for a Certificate of Appropriateness for exterior modifications at the HENRY E. READING HOUSE, located at 1433 East Hall Street. The HENRY E. READING HOUSE is a contributing property within the TOMLINSON ESTATES HISTORIC DISTRICT (Ordinance 2006.17). The applicant is Carlos Dominguez. (PL200078 / HPO200001)

#### Presentation by Staff, John Southard, Historic preservation Officer

Mr. Southard informed the board that the property is listed in the Tempe Historic Property Register and the National Register. This was property was Platted in 1950. There are design guidelines that were approved in 2016. The Henry E Reading house was built in the 1950 which is one of the oldest homes. This is a contributing property. It is said to be a Type-B Model per 2006 field survey. Type-B examples can be viewed on pages 20,23,24,27,40 and 45 of the TEHD Design Guidelines. Mr. Southard showed the Commissioners several of the pages from the book. From the pictures that he presented it shows that it is a property without a great deal of ornamentation, simple post up front. This property has a hip roof with a car port extension to the front porch. This property has great deal of integrity. It does have a carport that is enclosed. At some point the carport was moved forward and to the west then originally constructed. This application is really quite simple the applicant is repaneling the windows that are in place. It will be for a new front porch cover. Mr. Southard went over the drawings of the home with the Commissioners pointing out what will be stay and what is going to be updated. The staff recommendation is

approval with a condition. The condition being that the design guidelines identify stucco as insufficient. The commission would need to suggest something in place of the stucco or authorize a certificate of no effect for material other than stucco prior to construction.

Chair Buss asked if there are any photos of what the property currently looks like.

Mr. Southard informed the Commissioners that he does have a photo. And went over what the property photo.

Chair Buss informed the commissioners that he is aware of the property because it is in his neighborhood.

Chair Buss Acknowledged Vice Chair Ball.

Vice Chair Ball asked if the Commissioners are being asked to accept the conditions prior to permit. As he understands where the roof line has been elevated on the front porch above it the original condition. That the original shade structure of the car port will be removed completely in lieu of stucco structure for the laundry room.

Mr. Southard stated the applicant is requesting a new height, however since it was built without a permit then it is up to the commissioners to determine if they want to approve that or not. He was not aware of the height alteration.

Presentation from Applicant representative: Carlos Dominguez

Mr. Dominguez informed the Commissioners that the work was being done without a permit. The intention on the house was to flip it for profit or use it as a rental home. The owner wants to make the home more energy efficient with new windows and doors. However, Mr. Dominguez did inform the owner that they are not able to do all of the request because it is a historic property. He is aware that some things can be replaced and keep the integrity of the home. Mr. Dominguez is open to changing the material from stucco to more finished material within the design guidelines. The height of the porch is in a more adaptive existing condition. He has informed the owner of the home that the plan is to create a single post from the roof to the concrete to create a more finished look. Then as far as the paint goes it will match the existing color of the homes.

Vice Chair Ball stated that he would like to follow up with as part of this work has been completed to date has the laundry room already been framed with a parapet roof construction higher than the existing eave of the main mass of the house.

Mr. Dominguez stated that it has not. The laundry is existing as it is. With his drawings it shows that it does have the same shape.

Chair Buss stated that he has lived in the area for a very long time and that the enclosed carport was done by a previous owner for as long as he can remember. The carport and front porch all used to be at the same height. The bottom of the roof and car structure was 7-foot top was 7' 6". The new carport is about 8' 3" it does then require a very tall parapet wall structure on top. Which then leaves the exposed parapet wall from the street. They went through a lot of work rebuilding it. The solution to bringing back some of the original character would be to get rid of the chunky bases of the post. And replace the 6 X 6 post with 4X4 for the size of the beam above being a 4X6 would look better construction wise.

Mr. Southard showed a picture of the way the house looks.

Mr. Dominguez went over the structure.

Chair Buss stated that he would like to see a better finish than the stucco and maybe do something about the eyesore of the side of the house where the parapet is exposed. He suggested lap siding for the finish and pointed out that the neighbor in the photo has a good example of what lap siding would look like.

Mr. Dominguez was in agreement with the changes.

Chair Buss stated that they do make a cement of the redwood product.

Mr. Southard stated that he did find a photo of the original materials and shared it.

Vice Chair Ball stated that one of the elements that are present in the diagrams that Mr. Southard is showing is the level of detail that is associated with the original framing that the eve condition of the porch includes a little raptor tail that adds a note of delicacy in addition to the 4X4 post and beam that is used in the original framing that is now missing from the current configuration of the porch. Based upon the elevations that are in the report. One of the things that might be considered as a stipulation in the report would be to expose some of the raptor tail by cutting down the depth at the board of the perimeter. That combined with the removal of the pyle wood base elements. Then painting the post and beams close to the original will help rectify the situation without bringing the eve back down to its original height. One of the challenges that these structures do have in having a shingles roof on that low slop is that the roof will not wear well over time. With the extremely low slop on the porch.

Chair Buss stated that it would almost be better that the height get higher above the car port.

Motion by **Vice Chair Ball** to approve the request for a Certificate of Appropriateness for exterior modifications at the HENRY E. READING HOUSE with the stipulation that requires the exterior coating of the laundry room to be completed in a horizontal lap bore siding that the extension of the patio cover goes to the southern exterior of the laundry room as illustrated on the proposed elevations beyond the extent of the original residential structure and that the base ply wood elements be removed from the post and the baton bore at the current roof structure be cut down to expose framing members and that the entire framing of the porch structure shall be painted and that the post be 4X4; second by **Commissioner Garrison**. Motion passed on **7-0** vote.

**Ayes:** Chuck Buss, Martin Ball, Chris Garraty, Elizabeth Gilbert, Gregory Larson, Joe Nucci, Jim Garrison

**Nays:** None

**Abstain:** None

**Absent:** Matthew Bilsbarrow, Laurence Montero

- 3) Discuss and consider preservation of the 1924 Fitzhugh & Byron-designed Tempe Depot as a component of the proposed redevelopment of the Macayo's Depot Cantina property (300 South Ash Avenue).

Presentation by Staff, John Southard, Historic preservation Officer

Mr. Southard informed the commissioners that the Tempe Depot was built in 1924 it was designed by Fitzhugh and Byron. The restaurant was tacked onto the Depot. The building does hold a great deal of integrity. With the southern platforms some additions in place are revisable. The depot was determined eligible for listing of registried historic places in the 1980's however at the time it was owned by the railroad and the railroad objected to listing. The Depot is not listed in the Tempe Historic Properties register. Therefor as the process goes on the Tempe Depot is not subject to any formal protection or review of the process. The team working on redoing the Depot would like to keep the significant.

Mr. Smith did state that he is not a preservation specialist like Mr. Southard however he has done quite a bit of development with the City. He has learned that two of the most important factors in doing that are technical ability and comment to the cause. And Mr. Shannahan has done work like this in the past and has proven that he does his homework and operates fairly.

Presentation from Applicant: Barry Shannahan and Manjula M. Vaz

Ms. Vaz informed the Commissioners that there have been technical issues as well as property owner issues that have taken the team a while to get to this point in the process. Due to Covid-19 the Historic preservation Commission is the first see the presentation and they are looking for feedback at this point.

Mr. Shannahan informed the Commissioners that RED is a 26-year-old company that being developing real estate in the retail arena in the Midwest Southwest locations. The company has had the opportunity to in 2006/2007 to acquire a number of blocks in downtown Phoenix which lead to the development of City Scape project helped fall in love with the mixed-use process. The company did a project in Dallas called Union. There was a hand holding project as well with fry's in downtown Phoenix called Block 23. Which is a 65,000 square foot Frys on 3 levels. A parking Garage for the residential. There is retail and restaurant above that with a Chase bank under construction as well. Then above that there are office spaces. The Company is excited to take on the Challenge of The Depot.

Ms. Vaz stated that with the site location the challenge is the shape of the property. The Depot is in the back of the property of the train tracks.

Mr. Shannahan informed the Commissioners that the current concentration to activate the ground level amazing transit connectivity of the site in addition to the lightrial that comes through the project to the station just 200 feet to the East. There will also be a stop for the train to stop just to the left of the second driveway on the drawings. The Maricopa studies of the transit services and program the train Depot is thought to be one of the communal. At the ground level wanted to build a retail presence. There will be an area for the office lobby the Hotel lobby. The depot itself will be brought into the scheme as a coffee shop or a bike shop. Then the retail space off to the right of the hotel lobby will be retail as well. The area between the tran Depot and the lightrial and Ash is covered by a building is seen as a plaza amenity area that can be used for program special events such as Farmers Market, Movies in the park, and Wine tasting.

Ms. Vaz stated that a thought they had of programing the plaza is what a person sees at Center Point in front of the theater next to the Jackrabbits the water feature, Christmas tree lighting and other events. That will bring people into the site and celebrate the depot.

Mr. Shannahan stated that they are talking with SRP with building the height of the buildings. As well as trash pickup. Three is also the thought process of a connecting ramp for the lightrial and tran drop areas. There is also be talks with having a full Hilton Hotel with a conference facilty and then the parking the garage to support them. At level 8 is where the office project begins. Mr. Shannahan went over the West Elevation of the building.

Mr. Shannahan stated that they did a project in Dallas where they did a art piece from a highly known artist. That they turned into a type of Mural that provides some of the screening to the garage. The company liked that ideal of connecting with a local artist and experiencing it in Tempe.

Chair Buss asked if there were any photos of how the Depot will look.

Mr. Shannahan stated that those have not been developed yet. The intent is to restore the Depot as they can to its original conditions.

Vice Chair Ball stated that he appreciates the team joining to give a brief view of what the plans are on the site. That the group is trying to maintain the original structure of the Depot. One thought that he would like to offer the design team is that the respect for the original structure and the character of the space and which it sits might be improved if one omits the parking above the deck immediately above the station in order to give it a little more breathing room within its new home.

#### 4) Chair/Staff Update

Mr. Southard informed the Commissioners that the HPC Conference that was to be held in Tempe this year has been canceled. There will be a one-day virtual conference that is scheduled for June 18, 2020. Next year the Conference is to be held in Phoenix as planned.

Congratulations to the Commission for being involved in each of the projects that lead to the winning of the Govern preservation award for the Tempe Butte beatification that is the undergrounding of the powerlines and the water tank project as well as the removing of the Towers. The project is also being selected for the Garrison award.

The Hayden house is coming along. They are currently working on the mill ave adobe wall. There is a small portion of the East side of the Rio Salado elevation. Next door there is work for the office space. There is an approved protection plan for the office project. There are vibration sensors in place with alerts via text and email if the levels are exceeded. Process in place to review and determine what caused them to prevent it from happening again.

There a few small projects with people seeking for certificate with no effect.

There has been continued progress on the 1961 and 1975 survey of inventory. There has been a meeting with the Logan Simpson Team regarding the culture resource inventory and protection plan.

Hearing adjourned at 7:26pm

-----  
Prepared by: Brittainy Nelson, Administrative Assistant  
Reviewed by:

A handwritten signature in blue ink that reads "Steve A. Abrahamson". The signature is written in a cursive style and is positioned above a horizontal line.

Steve Abrahamson, Principal Planner

SA:bn