

Minutes Tempe Aviation Commission March 12, 2019

Minutes of the Tempe Aviation Commission meeting held on February 12, 2019, 6:30 p.m., at the Public Works Conference Room, Garden Level, City Hall Complex, 31 E. Fifth Street, Tempe, Arizona.

(MEMBERS) Present:

Lane Carraway (Vice Chair)
Robert Dixon (on phone)
Shannon Dutton
Gordon Gauss (on phone)
Valeriy Khaldarov
John Q. Nunes (Chair)
Trevor Pan
Peter Schelstraete

(MEMBERS) Absent:

W. David Doiron (Excused)

City Staff Present:

Oddvar Tveit, *Environmental Quality Specialist*

Agenda Item 1 – Call to Order

Mr. John Q. Nunes called the meeting to order at 6:31 p.m.

Agenda Item 2 – Public Appearances

There were no public appearances.

Agenda Item 3 – Consideration of Meeting Minutes (January 8, 2019)

Mr. John Q. Nunes asked for comments to the drafted January 8, 2019 meeting minutes, and a motion to approve.

Motion: Mr. Lane Carraway moved to approve the minutes as drafted. Mr. Robert Dixon seconded the motion.

Action: The drafted January minutes were approved. Ayes: Mr. Lane Carraway, Mr. Robert Dixon, Ms. Shannon Dutton, Mr. Gordon Gauss, Mr. Valeriy Khaldarov and Mr. Trevor Pan. Abstentions: Mr. John Q. Nunes Nays: None. Absent: Mr. Peter Schelstraete Mr. W. David Doiron.

Agenda Item 4 – Staff Update

Commission's supplemental budget request: Mr. Oddvar Tveit informed the members about the ongoing process of processing supplemental budget requests including the Noise Abatement office staffing request. One of the questions for staff to consider is the appropriate budget allocation for a new position.

CAMP: The work on the Comprehensive Asset Management plan for the Phoenix Sky Harbor International Airport is progressing. Community focus group and technical advisory committee meetings were held on January 30, 2019.

PAUWG: The PHX TRACON canceled the February 14, 2019 Phoenix Airspace Users Working Group (PAUWG) meeting because of the workloads experienced after the federal shutdown.

Mr. Lane Carraway left the meeting at 6:40 p.m.

Agenda Item 5 – Annual Compliance & Noise Report

Mr. Oddvar Tveit presented the items that have been included in the annual reports: a) Annual compliance with noise mitigation flight procedures over Tempe. b) The total number of noise complaints received by the City. c) Noise levels registered by the fixed airport noise monitors located in Tempe. He pointed to the following trends:

- *4-DME Compliance:* After the implementation of area navigation (RNAV) and RNP (Required Navigation Performance) departure routing at PHX in 2014, the overall compliance rates with the Tempe compliance measurement tool, the “Tempe Corridor” has improved. The best performing larger airlines are typically Alaska, American and Southwest with eighty plus percent of their departures staying inside the Tempe Corridor. Delta and United are less consistent but made improvements in 2018 accomplishing seventy percent or more in compliance with the Tempe Corridor. All cargo airlines made marginal improvements to low compliance rates. FedEx was the exception with seventy-two percent compliant take-offs in 2018.
- *East-West Equalization:* The overall split of jet and large turboprop departures east and west stays relatively constant over the years with fifty plus percent departing west and forty-five or more going east. The east side of the airport is burdened with more of the night-time departure activity than the west side. The night-time east flows have marginally decreased over the years and in 2018 it dropped to fifty-three percent.
- *Noise Complaints:* Complaints to Tempe has been falling and resulted in making quarterly instead of monthly reports for 2018. The Tempe website encourages residents to address noise complaints directly to the PHX administration and make use of smart phone and the PublicVue web application to look up disturbing flights and file noise complaints. The trend for aircraft noise complaints received by the City is more complaints coming from households in zip codes 85282 and 85283.
- *Noise Exposure:* Noise data are presented in traditional averaged levels used by airports to determine noise footprints. It can be questioned how informative the included graphs are to the residents.

Mr. Peter Schelstraete joined the meeting at 7:00 p.m.

Mr. Valeriy Khaldarov presented his own analysis of the Tempe and Phoenix annual reports:

- There is no depiction of one month of east departure flight tracks. This was included in previous annual reports. Periodic reports made available on-line do not cover reports published prior to the 2018 quarterly reports. The reports should include monitoring data and noise sensitive areas. Would have been helpful to enable access on-line map where residents could zoom in and see if flight tracks go over schools and get altitude information.
- Tempe excludes weather impacted departure deviations from the calculation of compliance with noise mitigation flight procedures over Tempe. In the quarterly reports an account of winds during the four quarters of 2018 represents about one order of magnitude difference between the first and second halves of the year, 36.00 v. 1.08 days excluded. More than twenty days are excluded from the fourth quarter.
- In the quarterly reports, perhaps the account of weather impacted days should also include the number of large turboprop departures which also are excluded from the calculation of compliance rates.
- No significant difference can be inferred for either the overall compliance rate or complaints received when you compare PHX Gate compliance rates with complaints received by Tempe. When Mr. Oddvar Tveit showed complaints registered in the PHX NOMS data base for October 2018, in total of 1,071 complaints were registered from twelve Tempe residents.
- After reviewing the complaint statistics in the 2012 annual report and comparing them to the 2012 noise survey, accessible at <https://www.tempe.gov/home/showdocument?id=17463>. It is fair to conclude that resident’s responses on page 8, 9, 13 and 15 of the survey are still as representative in 2018 as they were back in 2012 and 2013.
- What about developing a departure frequency test? The commission could discuss using aircraft flow rates, stipulating overflight intervals of two per minute, two per day or to two per week depending on where you live in the City in another noise survey. Based on the City of Phoenix noise annual report for 2017 the annual number of operations per year, 430,968 (2017), that is 1,181 per day, 98 per hour of a twelve-hour day and two per minute. If half is going east and the 4-DME Gate compliance rate is 99.5%, the non-

compliance rate is 0.5% and the maximum number of non-compliant departures is 539 or a couple per week. This approach could help residents understand aircraft frequencies.

- The report should contain a one-page summary.

Discussions:

- Tempe residents have been desensitized, they need to be encouraged to file complaints.
- Arrivals coming in on a stabilized three-degree glide slope approach create little noise. It is when the aircraft enter the final to get to the airport quickly and the pilots adjust flap- and power settings that create a lot of noise. How do we get them to a public meeting to address the issues?
- How is the City of Phoenix following up deviations? Are they getting responses from airlines?
- Night equalization of air carrier departures needs to be addressed. The direction of departure flow during night time hours is impacted by prevailing winds and by airlines bringing their planes home east to stage them for the next day's production.
- The controllers are too eager to accommodate request from pilots that bring aircraft off the main paths.
- Over areas of zip code 85283 east departing jets are on reduced power after initial climbs and turns back west.
- Looks like the way answers in the 2012 survey are formulated, many answers came from the same persons.

Follow Up: Staff was asked to provide unfiltered 4-DME gate compliance data for the last quarter, report on the criteria for excluding departure deviations because of weather and to include last quarter for turboprop aircraft departures.

Agenda Item 6 – Public Aviation Meeting in Tempe in 2019

Mr. Oddvar Tveit stated that the postponed FAA's workshops might be rescheduled to occur in April 2019. The FAA will disclose input received at workshops in February 2018 and any resulting flight procedure changes. The agency might also review the west departure re-routing that were completed in 2018 under the [agreement](#) with the Phoenix petitioners. The commission deferred setting a date for a public meeting in Tempe until the dates for the FAA's workshop are known.

Discussions:

1. Who to invite: Representatives from the airport, and the airlines; American, Southwest, Delta and United and the FAA.
2. Notice: The invitees need to know the subject matter in advance of the meeting.
3. Topics: For example, deviations from published flight paths and the interception of runway glide slopes.
4. Format: Have a moderator for a discussion panel to whom residents have submitted written questions, which can be read by designated Tempe officials. Have the residents' responses during the meeting written down and read by the same officials. Have commissioners help sort questions under each subject matter topic.
5. Location: City Hall would be a preferred location.
6. Postings: Include the event in the Tempe Today/ water bill.

Follow Up: Staff to check City Hall availability for the month of May 2019. The chair would reach out to potential invitees.

Agenda Item 7 – Commissioners’ business

- Further discussion of the annual report with requested data.
- Supplemental Budget Request for staffing a City Noise Abatement Office.
- Availability of preferred public aviation meeting location and next steps.

Agenda Item 8 – Schedule next TAVCO meeting

The next meeting was scheduled for March 12, 2019.

Agenda Item 9 – Adjournment

Motion: Mr. Peter Schelstraete moved to adjourn the meeting. Ms. Shannon Dutton seconded the motion.

Action: The meeting was adjourned at 8:02 p.m. by a unanimous vote. Ayes: Mr. Robert Dixon, Ms. Shannon Dutton, Mr. Gordon Gauss, Mr. Valeriy Khaldarov, Mr. John Q. Nunes, Mr. Trevor Pan and Mr. Peter Schelstraete.

Abstentions: None. Nays: None. Absent: Mr. Lane Carraway and Mr. W. David Doiron.

Prepared by: Oddvar Tveit

Reviewed by: Justin Bern

Attachment: Summary from Mr. Valeriy Khaldarov of agenda item 5 discussion arguments.

Summary (to be submitted for the record and entered into the minutes)

1. The 2018 Phx East Compliance Reports (First, Second, Third and Fourth Quarter) and Noise Mitigation Monitoring Summary state that information on the departures deviations due to the direction from air traffic control or adverse weather and large turboprop aircraft are excluded from the total deviations tally. It is an opinion of at least one of nine TAVCO commissioners that such information should still be made available to the general public in the form of maps like the one presented during this meeting since it may help Arizona families assess significant economic and / or quality of life decisions. For example based on the information compiled from the various sources by this individual, for the month of December 2017 the data from the noise operations management system (NOMS) shows that at least one elementary school in Tempe (Rover Elementary School, zip code area 85283) was under the flightpath while another (Thew Elementary School, zip code area 85281) was not.
2. The Noise Mitigation Monitoring Summary Draft for 2018 does not disclose (nor gives comparison to the previous years) the number of days excluded from the total tally of deviations due to the direction from air traffic control or adverse weather (about 37 days in total or about 10% for 2018).
3. The Noise Mitigation Monitoring Summary Draft for 2018 displays isometric views of both the PHX 4-DME Gate and the Tempe Corridor but does not state the period nor gives any indication whether these depictions represent actual flight results during the year. Past reports, however, contain top views of the jet departure tracks for the month of December inside the Tempe Corridor and the Phoenix Gate. It is an opinion of at least one of nine TAVCO commissioners that the actual flights for the whole year be disclosed for the benefit of the general public. It is also suggested among other things that such information be presented in the form of the top view map like the one presented during the meeting containing necessary details such as the activity period, 65 DNL contour, as well as some designated locations inside the city of Tempe boundary.
4. The Noise Mitigation Monitoring Summary Draft for 2018 reports complaints received during the year to be 43. At the November 13, 2018 meeting however Mr. Oddvar Tveit presented Report Module – Complaints slide that showed 1,071 complaints from 12 complainants for the month of October.
5. Important metrics (such as compliance rate and complaints received) were compared for time periods for 2018 and 2017 years against 2013 and 2012 period. It is an opinion of at least one of nine TAVCO commissioners that these results have not shown any significant differences for those years. Because of this, the results leave at first glance an impression that the Intergovernmental Agreement (IGA) (between the City of Tempe and City of Phoenix that the airplanes stay within the Salt River Bed) is in compliance. However the Aircraft Noise Survey (conducted between December 2012 through March 2013) along with one of the nine TAVCO commissioners personal experiences (whose residence is located on Apache Boulevard and Dorsey Lane) paint a different picture to what is being reported by the NOMS. In particular this individual believes that the actual flights are distributed between University Drive and Broadway Road. In addition when he tries to track the actual flights which pass through his residence through Symphony Harris PublicVue online tool, he found that this tool shows wrong flight patterns.