



Memorandum

TO: Rosa Inchausti, City Manager

FROM: Bill Greene, City Auditor

CC: Greg Ruiz, Deputy City Manager

DATE: September 13, 2023

SUBJECT: CONSULTANT CONTRACT REVIEW

Purpose

The purpose of this consulting engagement was to:

- evaluate compliance with key provisions of agreements between Vanguard Strategies and Consulting, LLC (Consultant) and the City of Tempe (City), and;
- identify potential improvements to City contract management processes.

This project was conducted at the request of the City Manager's Office.

Background

The City entered into an agreement with Vanguard Strategies and Consulting, LLC in November 2022 to provide professional services through June 30, 2023. The original contract stipulated compensation on an hourly rate, capped at a maximum payment threshold of \$62,500. In June 2023, the agreement was extended through December 31, 2023. The City terminated the agreement in August 2023.

Scope and Methods

The objective of this consulting engagement was to provide information as described in the purpose statement above. The work performed does not constitute an audit in accordance with *Government Auditing Standards*.

To achieve our stated objectives, we conducted the following review steps:

- Obtained executed copies of all relevant agreements, reviewed procurement processes, and identified key contract provisions;
- Interviewed the Consultant and City staff;

- Requested descriptions of contract deliverables and other supporting documentation from the Consultant;
- Evaluated compliance with stipulated insurance requirements;
- Reconciled contract payments to the City's financial system;
- Verified if payments complied with contract provisions;
- Determined the adequacy of invoice support;
- Assessed management processes used to ensure the execution of deliverables and payments in accordance with contract requirements.

Results

1. The Consultant did not adhere to insurance contract provisions. Due to ambiguities in the contract language and inadequate documentation, it was not possible to determine whether services were provided in accordance with the contract stipulations or if the City was appropriately billed for the activities undertaken.

IAO conducted interviews and reviewed documentation to verify compliance with contract provisions concerning service deliverables, payments, and insurance. We observed the following:

A. Service Deliverables

The City's contract with the Consultant stipulates the following services in Section 1. Services:

- The Consultant will work directly with City Management, Mayor and City Council, and the Chief of Staff to the Mayor and Council and the Aides to the Council. Potential duties include but are not necessarily limited to: Identifying and implementing targeted outreach strategies to engage residents, businesses, and others most likely affected by council policy initiatives currently under consideration.
- Work with the Mayor and Council and their staff to evaluate their current outreach efforts, both individually and collectively, and to make recommendations for ways to better notify, engage, and be responsive to both selected groups and the wider community.
- Undertake an analysis of the current structure and format of the City Council meeting agendas and parliamentary procedures, to make recommendations regarding effective strategies for increasing participation and community input during Council meetings, especially among historically underrepresented groups in the community, and in particular through effective use of technology, accommodation of all abilities, and equity.

- Research and analyze the current ways city staff interact with Mayor and Council, and their staff, to make recommendations as to how to best communicate and work effectively in preparation for Council meetings, retreats, Council Committee meetings, and Council constituent outreach.
- Prepare memos and reports, and give presentations as needed and directed in order to accomplish the stated purposes of the consultancy. Consultant will work directly with and for the City Manager or his designee as an independent Consultant. While it is expected that Consultant will have his own office off site, it is also understood that he may from time to time utilize city offices and workstations for completion of tasks as assigned. Consultant will meet regularly with the City manager or designee to give updates and status reports, as well as receive feedback and direction.

The contract contains no specific completion milestones or clear expectation as to the form of documentation required to demonstrate completion of service tasks. As a result, we requested the Consultant provide a description of services rendered under this agreement, including a description of the nature of the deliverables (e.g., memo, report, presentation, etc.) and copies of any related documentation.

In response to the IAO's request, the Consultant provided a report titled *Community Outreach & Liaison Consultant for City Council* (See Attachment A). This document offers an overview of the five service areas outlined in the contract and their associated outcomes. In this report, the Consultant discussed his contributions made in collaboration with City staff during the contract, such as:

- Developing and implementing a City of Tempe podcast.
- Assisting and advising the Tempe Police Leadership in the creation of new Hate Crimes Protocols and website engagement.
- Assisting the Human Rights Committee in securing the Keynote speaker for the MLK Diversity Breakfast.

In interviews with the Consultant, the IAO learned that City staff did not request specific deliverables throughout the entire duration of the contract. In the report, the Consultant expressly stated, "I was not instructed to produce any specific presentations or reports." Due to the lack of tangible deliverables that could serve as evidence of the work performed, it was not possible to conclusively determine if services described by the Consultant met contract requirements.

B. Payments

1. Invoices

Throughout the contract term, the Consultant submitted monthly, summary invoices containing only the total hours worked for the month multiplied by the hourly rate. According to the Consultant, no additional support was requested or submitted.

IAO requested that the Consultant provide additional documentation substantiating the hours worked for all invoices submitted to the City under this agreement, including a description of how the time billed related to contractual service areas included in the contract (Section 1 above).

In response to our request, the Consultant submitted billing details covering the period from November 2022 through July 2023. These details comprised a daily breakdown of hours billed, the corresponding "service category" specified in the contract, and task descriptions (e.g., Meeting with John Smith, Agenda Review Meeting, In-Office). While each task was associated with a contract service area, there was a lack of explanation regarding how these scheduled tasks contributed to fulfilling the service area activities outlined in the contract. Although the billing details accurately reflected the total hours billed, they did not establish a clear connection between billing tasks and the services outlined in Section 1 of the contract.

2. Payment Maximum

Contract Section 2 states, "Total payments during this consultancy shall not exceed \$62,500." We calculated cumulative City payments to the Consultant totaling \$68,280 for the same period (November 2022 through June 2023). In June 2023, staff noted that the Consultant would exceed the maximum contract amount. As a result, approval was granted to increase the purchase order by \$5,780 to accommodate the June invoice amount (See following table). Typically, a more formal contract modification (amendment) is executed to adjust a contract maximum payment amount.

| Contract Payments | | |
|--------------------------|-----------------------|-----------------------|
| Invoice Date | Invoice Number | Invoice Amount |
| 12/1/22 | 100 | \$2,130 |
| 12/29/22 | 101 | \$7,320 |
| 1/31/23 | 102 | \$10,200 |
| 2/28/23 | 103 | \$10,140 |
| 3/31/23 | 104 | \$10,830 |
| 4/28/23 | 105 | \$9,300 |
| 5/31/23 | 106 | \$8,760 |
| 6/30/23 | 107 | \$9,600 |
| Total | | \$68,280 |
| 7/31/23 | 108* | \$10,950 |

Note*: Invoice not yet paid

C. Insurance

Section 8 of the contract requires that the Consultant procure specific insurance. It also stipulates that this coverage must remain in full force and effect until all work or services specified in the contract are satisfactorily completed and formally accepted by the City.

According to Section 8.D., "...Failure to do so shall constitute a material breach of this Contract."

The Consultant claims that he did not secure the necessary insurance coverage based on advice from his attorney. According to him, his attorney believed that the mandated coverage areas did not pertain to the services outlined in his agreement. IAO sought guidance from the City's Risk Management Division staff, who clarified that all insurance requirements in the contract are applicable, except for workers' compensation. Following our request, the Consultant provided a Business Binder receipt as proof of insurance coverage effective from August 16, 2023.

2. City funds were used to cover the Consultant's travel expenses for City business. Documentation we reviewed shows general approval of City-funded travel. Nonetheless, the contract lacks provisions detailing travel expectations, approval process, expense reimbursement procedures, and the correlation between these costs and the maximum contract value. A contract amendment should have been executed to reflect a change in project scope and associated costs.

The contract lacks provisions concerning City-related travel and the compensation of associated expenses. Typically, the City does not have a practice of reimbursing consultants for travel costs unless explicitly stipulated in the agreement terms. Email correspondence from the previous City Manager's office indicates the establishment of a procedure to reimburse the Consultant for approved travel expenses. Furthermore, additional instructions were given to the Consultant to align the reimbursement of travel expenses with the guidelines outlined in the City's travel policy.

Based on information provided by the Consultant and our review of City travel and payment records, the following table illustrates business trips funded by the City. At the time of our review, the expenses for one trip undertaken by the Consultant had not been submitted for reimbursement. (See Table below)

| City Funded Travel | | | | |
|-------------------------------------|---------------|-------------------|----------------------------|--------------------|
| Purpose | Destination | Dates | Cost | Status |
| Attend NOBLE National CEO Symposium | Detroit, MI | 4/13/23 – 4/15/23 | \$1,239.50 | Paid by COT |
| Attend NOBLE Conference & Symposium | Cleveland, OH | 7/20/23 – 7/26/23 | \$2,256.96 | Reimbursed by COT |
| Attend NAACP National Conference | Boston, MA | 7/26/23 – 7/31/23 | Unknown - Not yet received | Pending Submission |
| Total | | | \$3,496.46 | |

The Consultant's hourly billing records showed that the City was also invoiced for travel time and attendance in the previously mentioned conferences. The total hours logged

and the associated costs for the Consultant's attendance at these conferences amount to 121.25 hours and \$7,275, respectively.

3. We identified areas for contract management enhancement that would assist the City in ensuring adherence to contract provisions.

Clearly Define Contract Deliverables

Clearly defined deliverables provide a basis for measuring the success of a project. This makes it easier to evaluate whether contract goals have been met and the project was successful. Although services are described, the contract contains no specific completion milestones or clear expectation as to the form of documentation required or expected to demonstrate completion of service tasks.

Develop Contract Management Procedures

Formal processes are needed to ensure the execution of deliverables and payments in accordance with contract requirements. Specifically for this agreement, the following areas would have benefitted from additional attention:

- **Communication and Tracking of Contract Deliverables:**
Deliverables act as a foundation for effective communication between the client and the service provider. This helps maintain transparency, keeps both parties informed about the project's progress, and allows for timely adjustments if needed. A routine process to communicate and agree upon detailed deliverables and associated deadlines serves as a documented reference point for the project's objectives and scope and is valuable for future reference, audits, or reviews.
- **Payment Review:**
Monitoring compliance with payment provisions is a critical component of contract management. To conduct a thorough review of hourly billing invoices, it is important to request documentation sufficient to substantiate the billed hours and correlate these to contractual obligations. Cumulative payments should also be compared to the maximum compensation limit before granting approval.
- **Compliance with Insurance Requirements:**
According to the contract, issuance of a Contract Award Notice or Purchase Order is contingent upon the Procurement Office receiving all necessary insurance documents. Creating a verification step to confirm the receipt of up-to-date insurance certificates can assist the City in preemptively preventing any lapses in the mandated insurance coverage for contractors.

4. An alternative procurement method might have been more suitable for engaging this consultant.

A memo to the procurement file stated in part, “This purchase for outreach and community engagement services is deemed a Council initiated contract and therefore exempt from the City Procurement Code.” The memo also states Procurement Division staff worked with the City Attorney’s Office on this determination.

City Code Section 26A-1 (b) (12) - *General procurement applicability* states in part,

The provisions of this chapter are not applicable to the following types of procurements that by their nature are not applicable to the competitive process and therefore exempt from the Procurement Code. However, any procurements at or in excess of one hundred thousand dollars (\$100,000.00) require formal Council approval.

(12) Council initiated contracts;

City Attorney staff who contributed to this determination stated that the primary rationale behind it was the belief that the Consultant would receive instructions from and report directly to the Council. However, we discovered no evidence to suggest that the Council officially initiated this contract or that the Consultant reported directly to the Council. In fact, the contract explicitly specifies, “Consultant will work directly with and for the City Manager or his designee as an independent Consultant.”

Recommendations

1. Execute contract amendments to memorialize material changes to contract terms or conditions (e.g., adjustments to maximum payment amounts and the expectation and conditions for City-funded travel).

City Manager’s Office Response:

We concur with the recommendation. For future contracts in which consultants work directly for the City Manager, we will endeavor to execute contract amendments to memorialize material changes to contract terms or conditions.

For the Vanguard Strategies and Consulting, LLC contract, once the current City Manager learned the details of this agreement and the lack of contract amendments to memorialize material changes, an internal audit review was requested by the City Manager’s Office on August 2, 2023. Notice was provided to the contractor on August 16, 2023 that the agreement was being terminated.

2. For future agreements, clearly define contract deliverables and develop contract monitoring procedures and processes necessary to ensure adherence.

City Manager's Office Response

We concur with the recommendation. For future agreements in which consultants work directly for the City Manager, we will endeavor to clearly define contract deliverables and develop contract monitoring procedures and processes necessary to ensure adherence.

For the Vanguard Strategies and Consulting, LLC contract, once the current City Manager's Office learned the details of this agreement and the lack of clearly defined contract deliverables and documentation required to be maintained, an internal audit review was requested by the City Manager's Office on August 2, 2023. Notice was provided to the contractor on August 16, 2023 that the agreement was being terminated.

3. Request the City Attorney to develop criteria for identifying a contract as a "Council initiated agreement."

City Manager's Office Response

*We concur with the recommendation. It should be noted that the Mayor and Council **did not** approve the November 2022 Vanguard Strategies and Consulting, LLC contract. Once the current City Manager learned the details of this agreement and the procurement method, the City Manager's Office communicated with the City Attorney and have developed criteria for identifying a contract as a Council initiated agreement consistent with the provisions of Chapter 26 of the City Code. Specifically, before a determination is made that a particular contract is a Council initiated agreement, the City Attorney (or designee) should provide written assurance to the Procurement Officer that the Council took one of the following actions: 1) considered the matter in Executive Session and a consensus was reached to move forward with the Contract; or 2) Council approved the contract at a Regular Council Meeting. Additionally, any recommendation is not intended to override the legal requirements that exist in City Code, State law or any other governing authority concerning the content of the contract.*

IAO Review Team:

Bill Greene, City Auditor

Angela Hill, Senior Internal Auditor



Community Outreach & Liaison Consultant for City Council

November 2022 - July 2023

Roy M. Tatem, Jr.
Vanguard Strategies and Consulting, LLC
1940 W. Chandler Blvd. Suite 2-523
Chandler, AZ 85224

Overview

The following will provide a detailed overview of the work accomplished during the consultancy project between Vanguard Strategies and Consultancy, LLC and the City of Tempe as Liaison for the City Council. Each section of the initial scope of work will be addressed as well as additional work accomplished. Throughout the consultancy contract, Roy Tatem of Vanguard Strategies and Consultancy, LLC had frequent progress meetings with the City Manager, including reflective conversations regarding the deliverables for the contract, during which progress was deemed not only adequate but beyond even the initial idea of what could be accomplished. Therefore, the initial scope of work was expanded based upon the immediate needs of city leadership, depending on current circumstances and the situations presented. Below, a more detailed summary of the scope of work will be shared, including additional context where appropriate. A [photographic summary](#) is also available including events, activities, meetings and media coverage.

Scope of Work

The Contractor will work directly with City Management, Mayor and City Council, and the Chief of Staff to the Mayor and Council and the Aides to the Council. Potential duties include, but are not necessarily limited to the following objectives:

1. Identifying and implementing targeted outreach strategies to engage residents, businesses, and others most likely affected by council policy initiatives currently under consideration.
2. Work with the Mayor and Council and their staff to evaluate their current outreach efforts, both individually and collectively, and to make recommendations for ways to better notify, engage, and be responsive to both selected groups and the wider community.
3. Undertake an analysis of the current structure and format of the City Council meeting agendas and parliamentary procedures, to make recommendations regarding effective strategies for increasing participation and community input during Council meetings, especially among historically underrepresented groups in the community, and in particular through effective use of technology, accommodation of all abilities, and equity.
4. Research and analyze the current ways city staff interact with Mayor and Council, and their staff, to make recommendations as to how to best communicate and work effectively in preparation for Council meetings, retreats, Council Committee meetings, and Council constituent outreach.
5. Prepare memos and reports, and give presentations as needed and directed in order to accomplish the stated purposes of the consultancy.
6. Consultant will work directly with and for the City Manager or his designee as an independent contractor. While it is expected that the Consultant will have his own office off site, it is also understood that he may from time to time utilize city offices and workstations

for completion of tasks as assigned. Consultant will meet regularly with the City manager or designee to give updates and status reports, as well as receive feedback and direction

Objective Deliverables

Objective 1. Identifying and implementing targeted outreach strategies to engage residents, businesses, and others most likely affected by council policy initiatives currently under consideration.

An initial meeting with the City Manager took place to discuss the best way to be connected with city leadership and to be available as situational needs arose. One outcome of this meeting was the decision for Roy Tatem to have an office at City Hall to create an ease of availability and integration into efforts around community outreach. Additional meetings were arranged shortly after with above mentioned city leadership to identify needs and the most impactful outreach strategies.

The following needs elevated to the top based on those leadership conversations:

- Stakeholder Engagement: only a small group of Tempe citizens were currently engaged in the decision making process of the city
- Communication: need to make sure all Tempe stakeholders were aware of existing and future engagement opportunities, including existing and future meeting times
- Diversity: the Tempe Boards and Commissions were not diverse or a reflection of the population of the city
- Renaming Project: unanticipated controversy had arisen around the street renaming process
- Hate Crime Investigations: need to respond implement and execute the successful investigations of hate crimes within the City of Tempe in partnership with the City of Tempe Police Department

After the above needs were identified, strategies were discussed that could have the ability to engage both residents and businesses in a manner that allowed them to feel better connected to the decision making process of the city.

The following outreach strategies were put into place:

- Development and implementation of a City of Tempe podcast
- Expansion of Community Meetings to ensure engagement for all stakeholders
- Targeted Community Outreach
 - LGBTQ+
 - African- American
 - Muslim Community
 - Youth and Young Adults

- Latino
- Faith Leaders

Objective 2. Work with the Mayor and Council and their staff to evaluate their current outreach efforts, both individually and collectively, and to make recommendations for ways to better notify, engage, and be responsive to both selected groups and the wider community.

Initial meetings were held with the Mayor, City Council and their staff to determine existing outreach efforts and goals for future outreach efforts with the community. Although engagement happened with all city leaders, I spent a significant amount of time with Mayor Corey Woods, Councilwoman Doreen Garlid, and Councilwoman Berdetta Hodge discussing outreach strategies. One example of this more in depth engagement was the opportunity to assist and advise CM Hodge with implementing and promoting her Breakfast with Berdetta events throughout the City of Tempe. Another example of more in depth engagement took place with Councilwoman Garlid around Public Safety issues related to the Tempe Public Safety Task Force which is now regarded as the Community Safety Strategic Plan. In support of this work, I had multiple meetings with this team where I provided advice and feedback on the proposed Tobacco Ordinance. I also attended multiple community meetings in the evening hours about this particular issue. We discussed various strategies and methods to engage and increase community participation for her Human Services and Community Safety Council Committee meetings with CM Joel Navarro. I was also a part of planning larger events such as the City of Tempe Pride Month Celebrations as well as taking a lead role in the planning and execution of the City of Tempe Juneteenth Celebrations.

I also worked with Mayor Woods and his aide on a plethora of issues and community engagement strategies. I made sure that Mayor Woods was aware of various community meetings and events where his presence was requested. For example, he received invitations from the East Valley NAACP, organizations associated with the National Pan Hellenic Council (such as Alpha Phi Alpha Fraternity, Inc and the Tempe Alumnae Chapter of Delta Sigma Theta Sorority, Inc.), the Buffalo Soldiers, a number of religious leaders and clergy members, as well as various interested Tempe stakeholders. These conversations led to a variety of additional engagement opportunities for the Mayor such as a request for presenting the keynote at the African American Legislative Affairs Conference. In addition to these meetings, we established both an internal and external communication strategy to promote the participation in these opportunities by the Mayor.

Purposeful planning conversations took place with city leadership, including the City Manager, to develop these internal and external communication plans. One example of

direction I received from the City Manager was the development of the internal communication strategy to support the identified need to communicate internally around the increased occurrence of hate crimes in 2023 in the City of Tempe. To accomplish this goal, I worked closely with the Dept of Equity and Inclusion Director and the Tempe Police Department.

As the development of the larger external communication plan took place, we knew that a bold initiative was needed that could engage not only those who were already successful in communicating with the city but also those who felt disengaged or did not utilize existing communication avenues. To accomplish this large goal, I facilitated the creation and implementation of the Tempe This Week podcast with the approval of the City Manager, Andrew Ching and Communications Director, Nikki Ripley. Here is [a copy of the podcast plan](#) that I participated in creating with Kris Baxter and Nikki Ripley for a more detailed view of the plan.



Objective 3. Undertake an analysis of the current structure and format of the City Council meeting agendas and parliamentary procedures, to make recommendations regarding effective strategies for increasing participation and community input during Council meetings, especially among historically underrepresented groups in the community, and in particular through effective use of technology, accommodation of all abilities, and equity.

To complete the analysis of current structure and format of the City Council meeting agendas and parliamentary procedures, I attended City Agenda meetings as an observer and provided my input and feedback to the City Manager. I also met with the Interim Chief of Staff, Eric Iwerson about meeting format and the use of Robert's Rules of Order and Parliamentary Procedure training after observing on multiple occasions Council members incorrectly making motions to be passed by the Mayor and Council. I believe that my observation and concern was presented to the City Manager and City Attorney.

In observation of meetings it was determined that there was a need to engage historically underrepresented groups. Therefore, I engaged the AAAC (African American Advisory Committee) to increase participation among the African American Community in city events. One example of this is the MLK Diversity Breakfast, where I assisted the Human Rights Committee in securing the Keynote speaker for this event while making connections to Dr. Lois Brown at the ASU Center for Race and Democracy. This work was furthered during Black History Month and our Juneteenth events. One further example of this is the Tempe Alumnae Chapter of Delta Sigma Theta 50th Anniversary on June 9th and 10th. You can find an overview of this event at this link:

<https://dsttempe.org/celebration-overview>

For this event, I facilitated meetings with Mayor Corey Woods to secure his participation at this celebration at the Tempe Mission Palms where the Mayor made a special presentation and read a proclamation to the sorority. During this event I also made sure that the Mayor met prominent members of the community. This is only one example of how I served as a liaison between various community groups and stakeholders on behalf of the Mayor and City Council.

Another opportunity where we were able to elevate voices who had previously felt underrepresented in the work of the city was with the ordinance to ban flavored tobacco products. For this group I engaged with concerned Tempe citizens who were organizing in the community to encourage the city to pass an ordinance banning flavored tobacco products, but were unsure of how to best engage with city leaders. As a result I encouraged them to come to City Hall to voice their concerns to the council and present the data that they gathered. Many came to council meetings to testify and share their stories, providing an opportunity for members of local NAACP branches and other community groups to voice their needs.

Objective 4. Research and analyze the current ways city staff interact with Mayor and Council, and their staff, to make recommendations as to how to best communicate

and work effectively in preparation for Council meetings, retreats, Council Committee meetings, and Council constituent outreach.

To begin, I participated in staff meetings with the Chief of Staff and Council Aides to determine the existing ways that staff interacted with city leadership. In addition to these staff meetings, I would meet with Council Aides on a consistent basis to discuss various issues impacting the city and sharing the concerns of citizens as I was interacting with them in the community. Many of these meetings were facilitated by the interim Chief of Staff, Eric Iwerson. The staff meetings were conducted on a weekly basis at 9am on Wednesday mornings.

I was to be included in the Council retreat agenda but the council retreat was postponed as there was another leadership change at the Chief of Staff position. I believe that the change of leadership here at the Chief of Staff position created the largest barrier to creating a consistent long term plan in this area. However, I have been able to provide support to the Chief of Staff and Council Aides on multiple constituent outreach questions and concerns.

Objective 5. Prepare memos and reports, and give presentations as needed and directed in order to accomplish the stated purposes of the consultancy.

Although I worked with a number of city leadership and participated in a variety of committee meetings and councils, I was not directed to own the creation of any specific presentations or reports. However, I did participate in the co-creation and collaboration of a number of large projects related to the purposes of my consultancy. One example of this is the **Tempe Renaming Committee** during which, at the direction of the City Manager, I worked closely with city staff in the renaming process, the community informational meetings and the renaming implementation process. Back in October, Council directed staff to begin a process for renaming streets and parks currently named after documented KKK members. We also directed staff to review all historical documents, including new documents provided by community members and those related to the specific naming decisions, to ensure that our information was documented (e.g., was Redden Park named after the specific Redden family members associated with the KKK?). The Tempe History Museum conducted this research to ensure the new information did not alter their findings related to the individuals affiliated with the KKK. One alteration: Hudson Lane was named after EW Hudson, who was a KKK member. Hudson Drive was named after an unrelated Phoenix businessman, Clay Hudson, who was not a KKK member. Hudson Park' is not clear. The City is moving forward with the plan to rename streets and parks associated with known KKK members and we expect the AD-Hoc Renaming Committee, composed of Tempe residents, to be named this summer. In the meantime, staff posted a video explaining the research of the Tempe History Museum.

Another example is my work with the **Hate Crime Protocols**. From the outset of 2023, the City of Tempe experienced an increase in hate crimes and I was asked by the City Manager to take the lead of information gathering and the progress of investigations in the conjunction with the City of Tempe Police Department and the Chief Diversity Officer. The following are examples of incidents of hate crime that were addressed between January and July of this year:

- January 2023
 - James Family (Anti-Black)
 - Engraved Swastika (Anti-Semitic)
 - Justin Graham attack (Anti-Black)
- February 2023
 - Assault at Light Rail of ASU Student (Anti-Black)
 - Bomb Threat at Brick Road Coffee (Anti-LGBTQ)
- June 2023
 - LGBTQ Flag Burning (Anti-LGBTQ)

As a result of these incidents, I worked to assist and advise the Tempe Police Leadership in the creation of new Hate Crimes Protocols and website engagement. These Hate Crime Protocols for the Tempe Police Department focus specifically around reporting practices and data gathering. For more information about this work you can view the following links:

- [Hate/Bias Crimes | City of Tempe, AZ](#)
- [Protecting Our Community from Hate \(arcgis.com\)](#)

As a follow up, we were in the process of planning a Hate Crime Listening Tour during which I was planning to present and help facilitate additional conversations.

In March 2022 I also participated in the **Police Chief Hiring** process, beginning with participating in the interview process with City Council Members. During that Tempe Police Chief selection process I provided analysis of candidates to City Manager, Mayor and Council members individually. Chief Ken McCoy was also at the top of my list as selection for Chief out of all of the candidates based on the analysis of the data presented to me from the informational sessions and interviews, as well as police officer and community feedback. My final report for this work was delivered directly to the City Manager, Mayor and Council in individual meetings.

Objective 6. Consultant will work directly with and for the City Manager or his designee as an independent contractor. While it is expected that the Consultant will

have his own office off site, it is also understood that he may from time to time utilize city offices and workstations for completion of tasks as assigned. Consultant will meet regularly with the City manager or designee to give updates and status reports, as well as receive feedback and direction.

I happily accepted an office at City Hall which allowed me to be easily accessible and present which facilitated the creation of a successful relationship with all city leadership. From both this office and in other areas I met regularly with the following designees:

- Tempe Police Department
- Mayor Corey Woods
- Councilwoman Berdetta Hodge
- Councilwoman Arlene Chin
- Councilwoman Doreen Garlid
- Vice-Mayor Jennifer Adams
- Councilman Randy Keating
- Councilman Joel Navarro
- Tempe Chief of Staff
- Director of Diversity Equity and Inclusion
- Tempe Communications Director and Team for Podcast Production

Conclusion

Based on my experiences and observations during this engagement with the city of Tempe here are a few recommendations and best practices that would be a tremendous benefit to the city and the operations within city hall. The first suggestion that I would propose is the creation of a standardized onboarding process for Council Aides and support staff. This will create a cohesive working environment amongst the council aides and allow them to successfully support their council members. The council and council aides would be very well served with a Council Retreat to discuss and learn Parliamentary procedures and practices. It has been my observation that not all council members and council aides have the same level of understanding of best practices in parliamentary procedures. Also, council aides can express themselves about their role and workload in a retreat more effectively than the weekly staff meeting.

Hate crimes have been on the rise in America over the years and the city of Tempe is no different. During my engagement with the city of Tempe I have been working with the Tempe Police Department and the Director of Diversity and Inclusion to create hate crime protocols within the police department. I would like to recommend that the city engage in a city wide campaign promoting diversity, tolerance and peace with trusted community partners and stakeholders

while informing the community about the new hate crime protocols and how to successfully report a hate crime online if they would like to do so. With the appointment of Greg Ruiz as Deputy City Manager over Public Safety I would recommend that he directly engage with the Tempe Police Department and Director of Diversity and Inclusion to be brought up to speed on the progress of the hate crimes protocols.

Tempe this week: the podcast was created and launched this year and proved to be extremely successful as we engaged every member of Tempe City Council with coordination and support of the council aides. We provided education about the process of engaging the city and connecting with local officials while also supporting and promoting Tempe centered businesses and featuring various Tempe employees to share their roles and various events in the city. This podcast is a powerful community engagement tool and a modern way to communicate to the broader community about some of the inner workings of the city. I want to encourage continued support from the city for the podcast and continued engagement from the city officials and staff for the duration of the podcast.